IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE AT NASHVILLE

IN RE: AMENDMENTS TO THE TENNESSEE RULES OF PROCEDURE & EVIDENCE

No. ADM2014-01791

FILED

SEP 16 2014

Clerk of the Courts

Rec'd By

ORDER

The Advisory Commission on the Rules of Practice & Procedure annually presents recommendations to the Court to amend the Tennessee Rules of Appellate, Civil, Criminal, and Juvenile Procedure and the Tennessee Rules of Evidence. In August 2014, the Advisory Commission completed its 2013-2014 term and transmitted its recommendations to the Court. After considering the amendments recommended by the Commission, the Court hereby publishes for public comment the proposed amendments set out in the Appendix to this order.

The Court hereby solicits written comments on the proposed amendments from the bench, the bar, and the public. The deadline for submitting written comments is Wednesday, November 26, 2014. Written comments should be addressed to:

James Hivner, Clerk Re: 2015 Rules Package 100 Supreme Court Building 401 7th Avenue North Nashville, TN 37219-1407

and should reference the docket number set out above.

The Clerk shall provide a copy of this order, including the Appendix, to LexisNexis and to Thomson Reuters. In addition, the order and Appendix shall be posted on the Tennessee Supreme Court's website.

PER CURIAM

<u>APPENDIX</u>

PROPOSED AMENDMENTS PUBLISHED FOR PUBLIC COMMENT

[New text is indicated by	y underlining, and	deleted text is indicated	by overstriking.
---------------------------	--------------------	---------------------------	------------------

1	TENNESSEE RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE
2	RULE 3
3	APPEAL AS OF RIGHT: AVAILABILITY; METHOD OF INITIATION
4	[Amend Rule 3 by adding the new subdivision (h) (new text is underlined):]
5	(a) * * * *
6	(h) Cross Appeals and Separate Appeals Not Required in Civil Cases. – Consistent
7	with Rule 13(a), cross appeals and separate appeals are not required. Consequently, upon
8	the filing of a single notice of appeal in a civil case, issues may be brought up for review and
9	relief pursuant to these rules by any party.
10	Advisory Commission Comment [2015]
11 12	The amendment added subdivision (h), which refers to Tenn. R. App. P. 13(a)'s statement that "[c]ross appeals [and] separate appeals" are not required. Subdivision (h)
13 14 15 16	goes on to state that, upon the filing of a single notice of appeal in a civil case, issues may be raised pursuant to these rules by any party. Thus, after the filing of a single notice of appeal by one or more parties, other parties are not required to file a separate notice of appeal in order to raise their own issues in the appellate court.
10	in order to raise their own issues in the appendic court.

17	TENNESSEE RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE
18	RULE 9
19	INTERLOCUTORY APPEAL BY PERMISSION FROM THE TRIAL COURT
20 21	[Amend subdivision (e) as indicated below (deleted text is overstricken and new text is underlined):]
22	* * * *
23	(e) Filing the RecordSubsequent Procedure. After the answer is filed, or if no
24	answer is filed within the time permitted, the appellate court shall either grant or deny the
25	application. If the application is granted, the The trial court clerk must file the record on
26	appeal within 30 days from the date of entry of the order granting permission to appeal. The
27	filing of briefs following the granting of an application under this rule is governed by rules
28	27 - 30, unless otherwise ordered by the appellate court.
29	* * * *
30	Advisory Commission Comment [2015]
31 32 33 34	Subdivision (e) was amended by: (1) changing the subtitle of the subdivision from "Filing the Record" to "Subsequent Procedure"; (2) adding the first sentence concerning the court's action on the application; and (3) adding the third sentence concerning the filing of briefs in cases in which the application is granted.

If the intermediate appellate court denies an application for an interlocutory appeal under Tenn. R. App. P. 9 and the Supreme Court subsequently grants permission to appeal, Tenn. R. App. P. 11(f), as amended in 2015, provides that the appellant's brief must be filed within thirty days of the filing of the record in the Supreme Court.

35

3637

38

proposed

TENNESSEE RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE

40 RULE 10

EXTRAORDINARY APPEAL BY PERMISSION ON ORIGINAL APPLICATION IN THE APPELLATE COURT

[Amend subdivision (d) as indicated below (new text is underlined):]

* * * *

(d) Subsequent Procedure. — If the appellate court is of the opinion that an extraordinary appeal should not be granted, it shall deny the application. Otherwise, the appellate court shall order that an answer to the application be filed by the other parties within the time fixed by the order. The order shall be served on all other parties and if the application has not previously been served shall have attached thereto a copy of the application. After the answer is filed, the appellate court shall either grant or deny the application. If the application is granted, the trial court clerk must file the record on appeal within 30 days from the date of entry of the order granting permission to appeal or within such other period as the appellate court may direct. The appellate court shall advise the parties of the dates on which briefs are to be filed, if briefs are required, and of the date of oral argument, if oral argument is granted.

* * * *

Subdivision (d) was amended to clarify the procedure to be followed when the appellate court orders the filing of an answer to the application for extraordinary appeal by permission. As amended, the subdivision provides that the appellate court shall either grant or deny the application after the answer is filed, which conforms the text of the rule to the actual practice followed by the appellate courts. The subdivision also was amended to provide that the record on appeal must be filed by the trial court clerk within 30 days of the order granting permission to appeal or within such other period as the appellate court may direct.



TENNESSEE RULES OF APPELLATE PROCEDURE

67 RULE 11

APPEAL BY PERMISSION FROM APPELLATE COURT TO SUPREME COURT

[Amend subdivision (f) as indicated below (deleted text is overstricken and new text is underlined):]

(f) Briefs. — Except as provided in the next paragraph, if H permission to appeal is granted, the appellant shall serve and file his or her brief within 30 days after the date on which permission to appeal was granted. If the appellant files a brief with the application for permission to appeal as provided in subdivision (b) of this rule, he or she may also file a supplemental brief, which shall likewise be served and filed within 30 days after the date on which permission to appeal was granted. Except by order of the Supreme Court, the argument in a supplemental brief shall not exceed 25 pages. If available, the color of the cover of a supplemental brief shall be blue. An appellant who elects not to file a supplemental brief shall, within 30 days after the date on which permission to appeal was granted, file with the clerk of the appellate court and serve on the appellee notice of the appellant's election not to file a supplemental brief; if the appellant fails to file a notice within 30 days, the appellee's time runs from the 30th day after permission to appeal was granted.

84 If the Supreme Court grants an application for permission to appeal from the denial 85 of a Tenn. R. App. P. 9 application, the appellant shall serve and file his or her brief within 30 days after the date on which the record on appeal is filed pursuant to Tenn. R. App. P. 86 87 9(e). The briefs filed in such cases shall otherwise be governed by this subdivision (f). 88 The appellee shall serve and file a brief within 30 days after filing of the brief or supplemental brief of the appellant or appellant's notice of election not to file a supplemental 89 proposed brief. 90 Reply briefs shall be served and filed within 14 days after filing of the preceding brief. 91 92 The briefs shall conform with the requirements of Rule 27. 93 Advisory Commission Comment [2015] 94 Subdivision (f) is amended to clarify the briefing schedule in those cases in which the 95 intermediate appellate court denies an application for an interlocutory appeal under Tenn. R. App. P. 9 and in which the Supreme Court subsequently grants permission to appeal. The 96 amendment provides that the appellant in such cases shall his or her brief within thirty days 97 98 of the filing of the record pursuant to Tenn. R. App. P. 9(e).

99	TENNESSEE RULES OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE
100	RULE 11
101	PLEAS
102 103	[Amend subdivision (b)(1) as indicated below (deleted text is overstricken and new text is underlined):]
104	(a) * * * *
105	(b) Considering and Accepting a Guilty or Nolo Contendere Plea.
106	(1) ADVISING AND QUESTIONING THE DEFENDANT. — Before accepting
107	a guilty or nolo contendere plea, the court shall address the defendant
108	personally in open court and inform the defendant of, and determine that he or
109	she understands, the following:
110	(A) The nature of the charge to which the plea is offered;
11,1	(B) the maximum possible penalty and any mandatory
112	minimum penalty;
113	(C) if the defendant is not represented by an attorney, the
114	right to be represented by counsel – and if necessary have the
115	court appoint counsel – at trial and every other stage of the
116	proceeding:

117	(D) the right to plead not guilty or, having already so
118	pleaded, to persist in that plea;
119	(E) the right to a jury trial;
120	(F) the right to confront and cross-examine adverse
121	witnesses;
122	(G) the right to be protected from compelled self
123	incrimination;
124	(H) if the defendant pleads guilty or nolo contendere, the
125	defendant waives the right to a trial and there will not be a
126	further trial of any kind except as to sentence;
127	(I) if the defendant pleads guilty or nolo contendere, the
128	court may ask the defendant questions about the offence to
129	which he or she has pleaded. If the defendant answers these
130	questions under oath, on the record, and in the presence of
131	counsel, the answers may later be used against the defendant in
132	a prosecution for perjury or aggravated perjury; and
133	(J) if the defendant pleads guilty or nolo contendere, it
134	may have an effect upon the defendant's immigration or
135	naturalization status, and, if the defendant is represented by
136	counsel, the court shall determine that the defendant has been

advised by counsel of the immigration consequences of a plea:

(K) if the defendant pleads guilty or nolo contendere to an offense for which he or she will receive an additional sentence of community supervision for life, the fact that he or she will receive the additional sentence, and, if the defendant is represented by counsel, the court shall determine that the defendant has been advised by counsel of the community supervision for life sentence and its consequences.

(2) * * * *

Advisory Commission Comment [2015]

Subdivision (b)(1) was amended to add paragraph (K) to conform the rule to the requirements of case law. "Because the mandatory lifetime supervision requirement is an additional part of a defendant's sentence, the trial court is constitutionally required to inform the defendant of the supervision requirement as part of the plea colloquy." Ward v. State, 315 S.W.3d 461, 474 (Tenn. 2010). See also State v. Nagele, 353 S.W.3d 112 (Tenn. 2011) (defendant allowed to withdraw guilty plea because trial court did not inform defendant of lifetime community supervision requirement and State failed to establish error was harmless beyond a reasonable doubt because defense counsel's advice to defendant about the requirement was ambiguous); Calvert v. State, 342 S.W.3d 477, 491 (Tenn. 2011) (defense counsel's failure to inform defendant about lifetime supervision requirement is deficient performance and defendant will be entitled to post-conviction relief if he establishes "by clear and convincing evidence a reasonable probability that, but for defense counsel's failure to inform him of the mandatory lifetime community supervision aspect of his sentence, he would have declined to plead guilty").

TENNESSEE RULES OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE 162 163 RULE 41 164 SEARCH AND SEIZURE 165 [Amend subdivision (c) by adding the following new (c)(2) and by renumbering the current (c)(2) and (c)(3) as the new (c)(3) and (c)(4), respectively (deleted text is overstricken and 166 new text is underlined):] 167 168 (c) Issuance and Content of Warrant. 169 170 (1) ISSUANCE. — * * * * 171 (2) REQUESTING A WARRANT BY TELEPHONIC OR OTHER RELIABLE 172 ELECTRONIC MEANS. — A magistrate may issue a warrant based on 173 information communicated by telephone or other reliable electronic means.

The proposed warrant, the signed affidavit, and accompanying documents may be transmitted by electronic facsimile transmission (fax) or by electronic transfer with electronic signatures to the magistrate, who may act upon the transmitted documents as if they were originals. A warrant affidavit may be sworn to or affirmed by administration of the oath over the telephone or by other audio or audio-visual means by the magistrate. The affidavit with

174

175

176

177

178

179

electronic signature received by the magistrate and the warrant approved by the magistrate, signed with electronic signature, shall be deemed originals. The magistrate shall facilitate the filing of the original warrant with the clerk of the court and shall take reasonable steps to prevent tampering with the warrant. The issuing magistrate shall retain a copy of the warrant as part of his or her official records. The issuing magistrate shall forward a copy of the warrant, with electronic signatures, to the affiant.

(23) Content. — * * * *

(34) HEARSAY. — * * * *

189 (d) * * * *

Advisory Commission Comment [2015]

Subdivision (c) was amended by adding a new paragraph (2) (and renumbering what are now paragraphs (3) and (4)). New paragraph (c)(2) allows a search warrant to be obtained without requiring the affiant and the issuing magistrate to be in each other's physical presence during the application/issuance process. The amendment to the rule does not alter the requirement that the affidavit be submitted to the magistrate in writing regardless of the means of transmission. Rule 41(c)(2) is intended to be construed liberally as to the method of telephonic and/or electronic transmissions as advancements in technology occur.

(new
nmits
heard
igned
tiated

213	
214	
215	

(C) state the essential facts constituting the criminal contempt charged and describe it as such.

- (2) FORM OF NOTICE. The judge shall give the notice orally in open court in the presence of the alleged contemner or by written order, including an arrest order if warranted. The notice and order may also issue on application of the district attorney general, an attorney appointed by the court for that purpose, or an attorney representing a party in the case.
- (3) RELEASE ON BAIL. The alleged contemner is entitled to admission to bail as provided in these rules.
- (4) DISQUALIFICATION OF JUDGE. When the contempt charged involves disrespect to or criticism of a judge, that judge is disqualified from presiding at the hearing, except with the alleged contemner's consent.
- (5) PUNISHMENT ORDER. If the court finds the alleged contemner to be in contempt, the court shall enter an order setting the punishment. The court may allow the award of attorney's fees and expenses to private counsel, either retained or appointed, for the prosecution of contempts arising under this Rule where the alleged act of contempt involves the failure to pay support to

230	a spouse, former spouse, or dependent. The court may not award attorney fees
231	or expenses in any other proceeding brought under this Rule. No fees or
232	expenses shall be awarded to the district attorney general, the attorney general,
233	or members of their respective staffs for the prosecution of any matter
234	involving the failure to pay support to a spouse, former spouse, or dependent.
235	(c) PLEADING AND HEARING. — A petition charging criminal contempt shall not be
236	joined in a pleading charging civil contempt. A charge of criminal contempt shall be heard
237	and concluded with a finding of guilty or not guilty prior to hearing further evidence relating
238	to a charge of civil contempt.
239	If a finding of guilty is made by the court, punishment, if any, by fine, incarceration,
240	or both, whether suspended or not, shall be announced prior to hearing further evidence
241	relating to a charge of civil contempt.
242	(d) DISCOVERY. — Discovery in a criminal contempt proceeding is governed by the
243	Rules of Criminal Procedure.
244	Advisory Commission Comment
245 246 247	Rule 42 tracks some of the language of the federal rule. No right to a jury trial exists upon a state charge of criminal contempt under present law establishing the penalties for the offense.

The reference in Rule 42(b)(2) to "a show cause order" was deleted. The burden of proof in a criminal contempt proceeding governed by subdivision (b) of the rule is on the district attorney or other attorney prosecuting the allegation of criminal contempt, and requiring an alleged contemner to "show cause" why he or she should not be held in contempt impermissibly placed the burden of proof on the alleged contemner.

Subdivision (b)(2) also was amended to add "an attorney representing a party in the case" in order to conform the rule to current practice. This rule also guides criminal contempt proceedings arising in civil cases that involve attorneys for the parties. See, e.g., Wilson v. Wilson, 984 S.W.2d 898 (Tenn. 1998).

Subdivision (b) also was amended to use the term "alleged contemner" throughout the subdivision, instead of only the word "defendant," to prevent confusion by distinguishing the person charged with criminal contempt from a named defendant in a particular case. A party charged with criminal contempt may or may not be a named defendant in the particular case. The new term conforms the language of the rule to the terminology in *Baker v. State*, ____ S.W.3d ____, ___, 2013 WL 4768309, at *6-7 (Tenn. 2013).

Advisory Commission Comment [2015]

Subdivision (b)(5) was amended by adding the second, third, and fourth sentences, which pertain to limiting the award of attorney fees and expenses in criminal contempt proceedings.

Subdivision (c) was added to the rule to set out the procedure for trial courts to follow in cases in which a respondent is faced with allegations of both criminal and civil contempt. Subdivision (c) provides that a petition alleging criminal contempt cannot be joined in a pleading that alleges civil contempt. The subdivision also provides that an allegation of criminal contempt must be adjudicated to its conclusion by the trial court prior to adjudicating an allegation of civil contempt. Additionally, subdivision (c) provides that, in the event the court finds the respondent to be in criminal contempt, the court must impose any punishment before hearing further evidence relating to an allegation of civil contempt.

Subdivision (d) was added to the rule to provide that discovery in criminal contempt proceedings is governed by the Rules of Criminal Procedure.

278	TENNESSEE RULES OF CRIMINAL PROCEDURE
279	RULE 49.1
280	FACSIMILE FILING OF PAPERS
281 282	[Amend subdivision (b)(2)(D) as indicated below (deleted text is overstricken and new text is underlined):]
283	(a) DEFINITIONS. —
284	* * * *
285	(b) FACSIMILE FILING; EXCEPTIONS. —
286	(1) * * * *
287	(2) EXCEPTION: FACSIMILE FILING NOT PERMITTED. — The following
288	documents shall not be filed in the trial court by facsimile transmission:
289	(A) An appeal from a lower court to a circuit/criminal
290	court;
291	(B) A notice of appeal to an appellate court;

292	(C) The affidavit of complaint for an arrest warrant or
293	summons (see Tenn. R. Crim. Proc. 4);
294	(D) Search warrants, affidavits, returns, and inventories
295	(see Tenn. R. Crim. Proc. 41) [Reserved];
296297	(E) A confidential document that the court previously has ordered to be filed under seal; and
298	(F) Indictments, presentments, and informations.
299	(c) * * * *
300	Advisory Commission Comment [2015]

302 303

304

305

306

307

308

309

310

311

312

The 2015 amendment deleted the text of subdivision (b)(2)(D), which listed "Search warrants, affidavits, returns, and inventories (see Tenn. R. Crim. P. 41)" among the documents that could not be filed by facsimile transmission. The deletion of "Search warrants, affidavits, returns, and inventories" from Tenn. R. Crim. P. 49.1(b)(2) does not mean that those documents may now be filed by fax under Tenn. R. Crim. P. 49.1. Rather, the Commission concluded for several reasons that Tenn. R. Crim. P. 49.1 did not actually apply to the search-warrant process. The most important of those reasons is that the procedures for obtaining a search warrant are governed by Tenn. R. Crim. P. 41, and that rule was simultaneously amended to authorize the use of electronic means (including facsimile transmission) in the search-warrant process. The Commission therefore concluded that deleting the text of subdivision (b)(2)(D) (and replacing it with "[Reserved]") would avoid any inconsistency between the two rules. The Commission further concluded that Tenn. R.

Crim. P. 41 properly governs the search-warrant process and that, as amended, Tenn. R.

Crim. P. 49.1 no longer applies to that process, one way or the other.

314

315

[end of Appendix]

proposed