

**SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE
 SUPREME COURT DISCRETIONARY APPEALS
Grants & Denials List**

Monday, February 17, 2009

GRANTS

STYLE/APPEAL NUMBER	COUNTY TRIAL JUDGE TRIAL COURT NO.	APPELLATE JUDGE JUDGMENT	NATURE OF APPEAL	ACTION
<u>Nashville</u>				
NONE				
<u>Knoxville</u>				
NONE				
<u>Jackson</u>				
Estate of Joyce Bell, et al v. Shelby County Health Care Corp. W2008-02213-SC-S09-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge Rita L. Stotts No. CT-006887-03	Farmer, J., Rule 9 Denied	Rule 11	Granted - Application of Estate of Joyce Bell, et al (Order attached hereto)

State of Tennessee v. Shawn Hatcher W2006-01853-SC-R11-CD	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge W. Otis Higgs No. 01-09093-95	Smith, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Granted - Application of Shawn Hatcher. (Order attached hereto)
--	---	------------------------	---------	--

**SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE
SUPREME COURT DISCRETIONARY APPEALS**

Monday, February 17, 2009

DENIALS

STYLE/APPEAL NUMBER	COUNTY TRIAL JUDGE TRIAL COURT NO.	APPELLATE JUDGE JUDGMENT	NATURE OF APPEAL	ACTION
<u>Nashville</u>				
In Re: Conservatorship of William Paul Ackerman M2007-00717-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Probate Court Judge Randy Kennedy No. 07P204	Susano, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - "Petition for Court to Review Application for Permission to Appeal" of Cathy Sue Drake (Lee, J., not participating)
William A. Appleton, Jr. v. The Civil Service Board of the Metropolitan Public Health Department of the Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County, Tennessee M2007-01062-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Chancery Court Judge Richard H. Dinkins No. 06-1271-IV	Franks, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of William A. Appleton, Jr. (Lee, J., not participating)

Rick Brush v. United Service Automobile Association, et al M2008-01619-SC-R11-CV	Stewart County Circuit Court Judge Larry J. Wallace No. 4-714-CV-07	Per Curiam, Dismissed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Rick Brush
Cannon County Board of Education v. Goldy Wade, et al M2006-02001-SC-R11-CV	Cannon County Chancery Court Chancellor Robert E. Corlew, III No. 02-102	Cottrell, J., Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Goldy Wade and Cannon County Education Association (Lee, J., not participating)
Clifton K. Crutcher, et al v. The Maury County Board of Education M2007-00244-SC-R11-CV	Maury County Circuit Court Judge Robert Lee Holloway, Jr. No. 10143	Cottrell, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Clifton K. Crutcher
State of Tennessee v. Deanthony Davis M2007-02238-CCA-R3-CD	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Cheryl Blackburn No. 2005-B-1274	Wedemeyer, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Deanthony Davis
State of Tennessee, ex rel., Bee DeSelms, et al v. Tennessee Peace Officers Standards Commission, et al M2007-01855-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Chancery Court Chancellor Ellen H. Lyle No. 07-343-II	Franks, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Dismissed as Untimely - Application of Plaintiffs/Appellants (Order filed 02-12-2009) (Lee, J., not participating)
Charles C. Dick v. State of Tennessee M2007-00542-SC-R11-PC	Maury County Circuit Court Judge Jim T. Hamilton No. 137021	McLin, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Charles C. Dick
James E. Fenton, Jr. v. State of Tennessee M2007-01661-SC-R11-PC	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Steve R. Dozier No. 2004-B-1241	Williams, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of James E. Fenton, Jr.

State of Tennessee v. David Kyle Gilley M2006-02600-SC-R11-CD	Rutherford County Circuit Court Judge Don Ash No. F-51237	Witt, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of David Kyle Gilley
William B. Herman v. State of Tennessee M2008-00517-SC-R11-PC	Rutherford County Circuit Court Judge Don R. Ash No. 52615	Wedemeyer,J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of William Herman
Roy S. Lawrence, et al v. HCA Health Services of Tennessee M2007-01128-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Circuit Court Judge Barbara N. Haynes No. 03C-795	Clement, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Roy S. Lawrence
Nina McKey, Administratrix of the Estate of Ruby Irene Brewer, Deceased v. National Healthcare Corp., et al M2007-02341-SC-R11-CV	Lawrence County Circuit Court Judge Robert Holloway No. CC-1972-06	Bennett, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of National Healthcare Corporation, d/b/a NHC Healthcare/Lawrenceburg, NHC/OP, L.P., NHC/Delaware, Inc. and National Health Corporation
State of Tennessee v. Raymond McNeil M2007-01566-SC-R11-CD	Williamson County Circuit Court Judge R. E. Lee Davies No. II-CR081268	Witt, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Raymond McNeil
Metropolitan Government of Nashville and Davidson County, Tennessee v. Walter Cuzzo M2007-01851-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Circuit Court Judge Thomas W. Brothers No. 05C-3309	Susano, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Walter Cuzzo (Lee, J., not participating)
State of Tennessee v. Chad Lewis Monette M2006-02462-SC-R11-CD	Houston County Circuit Court Judge Robert E. Burch No. 4678	Williams, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Chad Lewis Monette

John M. Murray, Jr. v. Tennessee Farmers Assurance Company M2008-00115-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Circuit Court Judge Amanda McClendon No. 06C3046	Bennett, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of John M. Murray, Jr.
State of Tennessee v. Melvin Nettles M2007-02405-SC-R11-CD	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Cheryl A. Blackburn No. 2007-B-1407	Witt, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Melvin Nettles
State of Tennessee v. Ronnie Owens M2007-02578-SC-R11-CD	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Cheryl A. Blackburn Nos. 2004-B-1436 and 2004-D-2545	Wedemeyer,J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ronnie Owens
State of Tennessee v. Maceo Parker M2007-00552-SC-R11-CD	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Steve Dozier Nos. 2005-C-2070 and 2005-C-2041	Woodall, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Maceo Parker
Gary Philpot v. Tennessee Health Management, Inc., et al M2006-01278-SC-R11-CV	Davidson County Circuit Court Judge Walter C. Kurtz No. 05-C-2209	Clement, J., Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Gary Philpot (Koch, J., not participating)
Eddie W. Phillips, Jr. v. State of Tennessee M2007-01920-SC-R11-PC	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Cheryl Blackburn Nos. 2005-C-1730 and 2005-C-2590	Thomas, Jr., J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Eddie W. Phillips, Jr.
Jose Luis Quintero v. State of Tennessee M2007-02068-SC-R11-PC	Wilson County Circuit Court Judge John Wooten Nos. 01-1290 and 01-1291	Thomas, Jr., J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Jose Luis Quintero

Ira Lynn Reagan, As Conservator Of The Property And Person Of Hazel Rayborn, An Incapacitated Person v. Kindred HC M2006-02191-SC-R11-CV	Putnam County Circuit Court Judge John Turnbull No. 04J0446	Highers, J., Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ira Lynn Reagan
State of Tennessee v. James H. Saint, Jr. M2007-00424-SC-R11-CD	Davidson County Criminal Court Judge Cheryl A. Blackburn No. 2005-C-2234	Tipton, J., Affirmed in Part; Reversed in Part	Rule 11	Denied - Application of James H. Saint, Jr.
Joseph Stinnett v. State of Tennessee M2007-02123-SC-R11-CO	Rutherford County Criminal Court Judge James K. Clayton, Jr. No. F-3418C	McLin, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Joseph Stinnett
<u>Knoxville</u>				
Timothy Callaway v. State of Tennessee E2008-00305-SC-R11-PC	Knox County Criminal Court Judge Kenneth Irvine, Jr. No. 81175	McLin, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Timothy Callaway
City of Knoxville v. Ronald G. Brown E2007-01906-SC-R11-CV	Knox County Circuit Court Judge Wheeler Rosenbalm No. 3-649-06	Swiney, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ronald G. Brown
State of Tennessee v. Brandon Compton E2007-01790-SC-R11-CD	Knox County Criminal Court Judge Mary beth Leibowitz No. 78832	Glenn, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Brandon Compton
State of Tennessee v. Frank Edward Davidson E2007-02841-SC-R11-CD	Cumberland County Circuit Court Judge Leon C. Burns, Jr. No. 9652	Smith, J., Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Frank Edward Davidson

State of Tennessee, ex rel., Bee DeSelm, et al v. Diane Jordan E2007-00908-SC-R11-CV	Knox County Chancery Court Chancellor Daryl R. Fansler No. 167799-2	Lee, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Plaintiffs/Appellants, Bee DeSelms, Jams Gray, Carl R. Seider, H.R. DeSelm, Jennifer Arthur, William S. Collins, Donna Brian, David Habercom, Mary Hook, Susan Jenkins, Miriam Levering; Denied - Motion of Plaintiffs/Appellants to consolidate; Denied - Motion of Defendants/Appellees to strike
Jane Stevenson Kalp Devereaux v. Jerome W. Devereaux E2007-02189-SC-R11-CV	Jefferson County Chancery Court Chancellor Forgety No. 05-138	Lee, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Jerome W. Devereaux (Lee, J., not participating)
State of Tennessee v. Dwayne Anthony Dixon E2007-02237-SC-R11-CD	Sullivan County Circuit Court Judge Robert Montgomery, Jr. Nos. S51,198 & S52,716	Witt, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Dwayne Anthony Dixon
Russell Ellison, et al v. Rose Ellison E2007-01744-SC-R11-CV	Claiborne County Chancery Court Chancellor Billy Joe White No. 15591	Susano, J., Affirmed as Modified; Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of rose Ellison (Lee, J., not participating)
James P. Hyde v. State of Tennessee E2007-02860-SC-R11-PC	Hamblen County Circuit Court Judge Tom Wright No. 99CR035	Witt, J., Ogle, J. and Thomas, J., Denied	Rule 11	Denied - Application of James P. Hyde
George A. Johnson v. State of Tennessee E2007-00920-SC-R11-PC	Sevier County Circuit Court Judge Rex Ogle No. 11358-III	Smith, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of George A. Johnson

J. William Johnson and Brent W. Johnson v. Reggie Merritt E2007-02311-SC-R11-CV	Blount County Circuit Court Judge William D. Young No. L-15853	Franks, J., Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of J. William Johnson, et al (Lee, J., not participating)
Bobby C. (Clark) King v. Sevier County Election Commission, et al E2007-02355-SC-R11-CV	Sevier County Chancery Court Chancellor Telford Forgety No. 07-5-181	Susano, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Bobby C. (Clark) King (Lee, J., not participating)
Charles Montague v. Howard Carlton E2007-02823-SC-R11-HC	Johnson County Circuit Court Judge Lynn W. Brown No. 3951	Woodall, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Charles Montague
State of Tennessee v. Thaddeus Eugene Reid E2007-01056-SC-R11-CD	Hamilton County Criminal Court Judge Don W. Poole No. 255036	Welles, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Thaddeus Eugene Reid
Jimmy Leslie Sluder v. Jack Morgan, Warden, et al E2007-01381-SC-R11-HC	Morgan County Circuit Court Judge E. Eugene Eblen No. 9126	Welles, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Jimmy Leslie Sluder
In Re: The Estate of Mattie E. Stringfield E2007-02887-SC-R11-CV	Knox County Chancery Court Chancellor Daryl R. Fansler No. 66234-II	Swiney, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Louis Hofferbert

Jackson

Howard Jefferson Atkins v. State of Tennessee W2006-02221-SC-R11-PC	Tipton County Circuit Court Judge Joseph H. Walker No. 3956	McLin, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Howard Jefferson Atkins
Elizabeth Bailey v. Mary Taylor, et al W2007-00208-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge James Russell Nos. CT-005594-05 and CT-002487-05	Highers, J., No. CT-005594-05, Reversed and Remanded; No. CT-002487-05, Dismissed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Mary Taylor, et al
State of Tennessee v. Robert Bonds W2007-02771-SC-R11-CD	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge James C. Beasley, Jr. No. 07-00564	McLin, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Robert Bonds
Marvin Catron v. State of Tennessee W2007-02408-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge John T. Fowlkes, Jr. No. P-25666	Glenn, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Marvin Catron
Ronald Dotson v. State of Tennessee W2007-01654-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge W. Fred Axley No. P-26559	Witt, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ronald Dotson

Eddie Lee Douglas v. State of Tennessee W2008-00395-SC-R11-PC	Hardeman County Circuit Court Judge J. Weber McCraw No. 06-01-0266	Glenn, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Eddie Lee Douglas
Jeanne W. Fickle v. James Edward Fickle W2007-01509-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge Robert L. Childers No. CT-002203-05	Farmer, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of James Edward Fickle
Robert T. Hogan v. Illinois Central Railroad Company W2007-01983-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge D'Army Bailey No. CT-000062-06	Farmer, J., Vacated and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Illinois Central Railroad Company
State of Tennessee v. Cordaro Hughes W2007-00955-CCA-R11-CD	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge Chris Craft No. 05-01013	Glenn, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Cordaro Hughes
In Re: Estate of William Anthony Lucy; Rita Clark, Shelby County Assessor of Property, et al v. Naomi Schutte, as Administratrix of The Estate of William Anthony Lucy	Shelby County Probate Court Judge Karen Webster No. D-1164-2	Kurtz, J., Affirmed in Part, Vacated in Part and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Rita Clark, Shelby County Assessor of Property, et al
Tom Moore, III v. State of Tennessee W2008-01673-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge Carolyn W. Blackett No. P-13826	Williams, J., Rule 28 Denied	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Tom Moore
State of Tennessee v. Billy Wayne Price W2007-02816-SC-R11-CD	Gibson County Circuit Court Judge Clayburn Peebles No. H-7132	Williams, J., Appeal Dismissed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Billy Wayne Price
Donald J. Roberts IRA, et al v. Phillip H. McNeill, Sr., et al W2008-01951-SC-S09-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge Jerry Stokes No. CT-004955-07	Highers, J., Denied Rule 9 application	Rule 9	Denied - Rule 9 Application of Phillip H. McNeill, Sr., et al

Marcus Stallworth v. State of Tennessee W2007-00675-SC-R11-PC	Shelby County Criminal Court Judge James M. Lammey, Jr. No. 02-09360	Ogle, J., Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Marcus Stallworth
Ahmad Suleiman, d/b/a Barksdale Market v. City of Memphis Alcohol Commission W2007-01806-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge Jerry Stokes No. CT-002570-07	Farmer, J., Reversed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ahmad Suleiman, d/b/a Barksdale Market
Doris P. Williams v. Jimmy D. Williams W2007-00109-SC-R11-CV	Shelby County Circuit Court Judge Robert L. Childers No. CT-005319-02	Kirby, J., Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Jimmy D. Williams

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE
AT JACKSON

ESTATE OF JOYCE BELL ET AL. v. SHELBY COUNTY HEALTH CARE CORP.

**Circuit Court for Shelby County
No. CT-006887-03**

No. W2008-02213-SC-S09-CV

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of the Estate of Joyce Bell and the record before us, the application is granted.

The Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument upon the completion of briefing.

PER CURIAM

IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE
AT JACKSON

STATE OF TENNESSEE v. SHAWN HATCHER

**Criminal Court for Shelby County
No. 01-09093-95**

No. W2006-018-53-SC-R11-CD

ORDER

Upon consideration of the application for permission to appeal of Shawn Hatcher and the record before us, the application is granted.

The Clerk is directed to place this matter on the docket for oral argument upon the completion of briefing.

PER CURIAM