

PRESIDENT Sam D. Elliott 320 McCallie Avenue Chattanooga, Tennessee 37402 (423) 756-5171 FAX (423) 266-1605 Email: selliott@gearhiserpeters.com

PRESIDENT-ELECT
Danny Van Horn
6075 Poplar Avenue
Suite 500
Memphis, Tennessee 38119
(901) 680-7331
FAX (901) 680-7201
Email: danny vanhorn@buttersnow.com

VICE PRESIDENT
Jackie Dixon
424 Church Street
Suite 2260
Nashville, Tennessee 37219
(615) 986-3377
FAX (615) 635-0018
Email: jdixon@wmdlawgroup.com

TREASURER
Flichard Johnson
511 Union Street
Suite 2700
Nashville, Tennessee 37219
(615) 850-8151
FAX (615) 244-6804
Email: rjohnson@wallerlaw.com

SECRETARY
Jason Pannu
201 Fourth Ave North
Suite 1500
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-8615
(615)259-1366
Fax: (615)259-1389
Email: jpannu@lewisking.com

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Gail Vaughn Ashworth

BOARD OF GOVERNORS Tasha Blakney, Knoxville Carl Carter, Memphis Patrick Carter, Columbia David Changas, Nashville Jason Creasy, Dyersburg James Crumlin, Nashville D. Michael Dunavant, Ripley Brian S. Faughnan, Memphis Chancellor Thomas R. "Skip" Frierson II. Morristown Bobby Hibbett, Lebanon Claudia Jack, Columbia Frank Johnstone, Kingsport Jack H. "Nick" McCall Jr., Knoxville Geraid Melton, Murfreesboro Jonathan Steen, Jackson Chris Varner, Chattanooga Mason Wilson, Memphis Cynthia Wyrick, Sevierville

> GENERAL COUNSEL William L. Harbison, Nashville

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR Allan F. Ramsaur, Nashville Email: aramsaur@inbar.org



# 2011 APR -7 PM 12: 13

April 7, 2011

AFFELLATE COURT CLERK NASI-IVILLE

The Honorable Michael Catalano Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court Supreme Court Building, Room100 401 Seventh Avenue North Nashville, TN 37219

> IN RE: AMENDMENT TO RULE 7, SECTION 14.01 -RULES OF THE TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT No. M2011-00526-SC-RL2-RL

> > **AND**

AMENDMENTS TO RULE 9, SECTIONS 1.3, 8.3, 13.7 AND 16.1 - RULES OF THE TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT
No. M2011-00527-SC-RL2-RL

Dear Mike:

Attached please find an original and six copies of the Comment of the Tennessee Bar Association in reference to the above matters.

As always, thank you for your cooperation. I remain,

Very truly yours,

Allan F. Ramsaur Executive Director

cc: Sam D. Elliott
William L. Harbison
Brian S. Faughnan
Service List

Tennessee Bar Center 221 Fourth Avenue, North, Suite 400 Nashville, Tennessee 37219-2198 (615) 383-7421 • (800) 899-6993 FAX (615) 297-8058 www.tba.org

# IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE AT NASHVILLE 2011 APR -7 PM 12: 13

IN RE: AMENDMENTS TO RULE 7, SECTION 14.01 AND TO RULE 9, SECTIONS 1.3, 8.3, 13.7, AND 16.1,
RULES OF THE TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT

Nos. M2011-00526-SC-RL2-RL and M2011-00527-SC-RL2-RL

#### COMMENT OF THE TENNESSEE BAR ASSOCIATION

The Tennessee Bar Association ("TBA") submits this Comment in response to the Court's invitation extended to the bench, the bar, and the public to submit comments concerning proposed amendments to Tenn. Sup. Ct. R. 7 and Tenn. Sup. Ct. R. 9. Those proposed amendments address the requirements for seeking the Court's review of any action of the Board of Law Examiners and concerning judicial review of the judgment of a hearing panel respectively.

Although the proposed revisions are not limited to Rule 9, it appears to the TBA in light of the Court's recent decision in <u>Board v. Cawood</u>, 330 S.W.3d 608 (Tenn. 2010), that the proposed revisions are motivated by a desire to address and remove confusion regarding what is necessary to perfect an appeal from administrative proceedings regarding issues involving the licensure of lawyers.

While the proposed revisions to Rule 9 would eliminate any reference to Tenn. Code. Ann. § 27-9-101 and any reference to "certiorari," and the proposed revision to Rule 7 would delete the reference to review "under the common law writ of certiorari," the TBA has some concern that the proposed revisions, as currently drafted, may create even further confusion by being construed as offering no real guidance as to what constitutes a "petition for review"

sufficient to trigger appellate jurisdiction. The TBA's concern is that the proposed revised rules could be read to impose no specific requirements at all, save for the title of the pleading having to be "Petition for Review." While the proposed revised Rule 9, Section 1.3 would read "filing a petition for review in accordance with Section 1.4," Section 1.4 currently only addresses where a filing must take place, Circuit or Chancery Court where the respondent's office was located when charges were filed by the BPR, and not what the filing must contain by way of content. The proposed revised Rule 7, Section 14.01 offers no cross-reference of any sort and appears to indicate only what a petition for review is not—it is not a common law writ of certiorari—as opposed to what it is.

Unless the Court's intention is for the only requirement for perfecting an appeal in these instances be captioning the filing as a "Petition for Review," the TBA respectfully suggests that the Court identify any such specific additional requirements in the language of the revised rules themselves. In light of the importance both of proceedings seeking review of decisions of the Board of Law Examiners and judicial proceedings seeking review of judgments of hearing panels in disciplinary matters, the TBA believes that including any such specific requirements contemplated by the Court in the language of the rules would assist parties in such proceedings and minimize the potential for future problems such as the one addressed in <u>Cawood</u>.

The TBA appreciates the opportunity to provide comment to this Court on these important issues and stands ready, should the Court desire any drafting assistance, to offer further assistance or a further proposal for how any specific requirements identified by the Court would be best incorporated into the proposed revisions under consideration.

## Respectfully Submitted,

### By: /s/ by permission

Sam D. Elliott (9431), President Tennessee Bar Association Gearhiser, Peters, Cavett, Elliott & Cannon, PLLC 320 McCallie Avenue Chattanooga, TN 37402 (423) 756-5171

### By: /s/ by permission

William L. Harbison (7012), General Counsel Tennessee Bar Association Sherrard & Roe, PLC 424 Church Street, Suite 2000 Nashville, TN 37219 (615) 742-4200

Allan F. Ramsaur (5764), Executive Director Tennessee Bar Association Tennessee Bar Center 221 Fourth Avenue, North, Suite 400 Nashville, TN 37219 (615) 383-7421

#### By: /s/ by permission

Brian S. Faughnan (19379), Chair Committee on Ethics & Professional Responsibility Tennessee Bar Association Thomason, Hendrix, Harvey, Johnson & Mitchell, PLLC 2900 One Commerce Square 40 South Main Street Memphis, TN 38103 (901) 525-8721

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

The undersigned certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the individuals and organizations identified in Exhibit "A" by regular U.S. Mail, postage prepaid on April 7, 2011. Allan F. Ramsaur