### MOORE & HEDGES

ATTORNEYS AT LAW

RICK L. MOORE rmooremh@lighttube.net

RUSSELL D. HEDGES russellmh@lighttube.net

JEFFREY E. SCHOFILL jschofillmh@lighttube.net

www.mooreandhedges.com

M2010-02373-50-RL2T

105 N. ATLANTIC ST. PO BOX 1810 TULLAHOMA, TN 37388

TEL: (931) 455-5789 FAX: (931) 454-9210

November 22, 2010

Mr. Michael W. Catalano, Clerk 100 Supreme Court Building 401 Seventh Avenue North Nashville, TN 37219-1407

RE: Proposed Repeal of Rule 37

RECEIVED

NOV 2 3 2010

Clerk of the Courts

Rec'd By

Dear Mr. Catalano:

I have done a number of workers' compensation appeals over the years. In each of those, since 2001, I have participated in the mandatory mediation. I do not recall any of the cases being resolved during the mediation process, or even a single issue being resolved during the mediation process.

From my perspective as an attorney for plaintiffs in this matter, it adds a cost to the employee and there has been absolutely no benefit to the injured working employee as a result of the required mediation during the appellate process.

I would strongly recommend repeal of Rule 37. If the parties want to engage in voluntary mediation, that of course is always a possibility and would have a greater likelihood of success. However, the current process is costly and wastes both time resources and monetary resources.

පත කතා වෙරදේ ප්රවේ අදුරුපා වේද සම හැරවී වැනි දේවෙන අදුරුණ් ලබන යුදුවලින්දේ වියායාලයක් අද

than in the regarding a second as adjusted with the goal of that day, the displayer print

tean a suite lette velt becomb tier to the estet i pocar

Sincerely yours,

RUSSELL D. HEDGES

RDH:cao de 1944 brance poglave de sur amorat al 1940



PRESIDENT Sam D. Elliott 320 McCallie Avenue Chattanooga, Tennessee 37402 (423) 756-5171 FAX (423) 266-1605 Email: selliott@gearhiserpeters.com

PRESIDENT-ELECT
Danny Van Horn
6075 Poplar Avenue
Suite 500
Memphis, Tennessee 38119
(901) 680-7331
FAX (901) 680-7201
Email: danny.vanhorn@butlersnow.com

VICE PRESIDENT
Jackie Dixon
424 Church Street
Suite 2260
Nashville, Tennessee 37219
(615) 986-3377
FAX (615) 635-0018
Email: jdixon@wmdlawgroup.com

TREASURER
Richard Johnson
511 Union Street
Suite 2700
Nashville, Tennessee 37219
(615) 850-8151
FAX (615) 244-6804
Email: rjohnson@wallerlaw.com

SECRETARY

Jason Pannu 201 Fourth Ave North Suite 1500 Nashville, Tennessee 37219-8615 (615)259-1366 Fax: (615)259-1389 Email: jpannu@lewisking.com

IMMEDIATE PAST PRESIDENT Gail Vaughn Ashworth

BOARD OF GOVERNORS

Tasha Blakney, Knoxville Carl Carter, Memphis Patrick Carter, Columbia David Changas, Nashville Jason Creasy, Dyersburg James Crumlin, Nashville D. Michael Dunavant, Ripley Brian S. Faughnan, Memphis Chancellor Thomas R. "Skip" Frierson II, Morristown Bobby Hibbett, Lebanon Claudia Jack, Columbia Frank Johnstone, Kingsport Jack H. "Nick" McCall Jr., Knoxville Gerald Melton, Murfreesboro Jonathan Steen, Jackson Chris Varner, Chattanooga Mason Wilson, Memphis Cynthia Wyrick, Sevierville

> GENERAL COUNSEL William L. Harbison, Nashville

EXECUTIVE DIRECTOR Allan F. Ramsaur, Nashville Email: aramsaur@tnbar.org



December 30, 2010

The Honorable Michael Catalano Clerk, Tennessee Supreme Court Supreme Court Building, Room100 401 Seventh Avenue North Nashville, TN 37219

IN RE: PROPOSED REPEAL OF RULE 37
RULES OF THE TENNESSEE
SUPREME COURT

No. M2010-02373-SC-RL2-RL

Dear Mike:

Attached please find an original and six copies of the Comment of the Tennessee Bar Association in reference to the above matter.

As always, thank you for your cooperation. I remain,

Very truly yours,

Allan F. Ramsaur Executive Director

cc: Sam D. Elliott, President, Tennessee Bar Association William L. Harbison, General Counsel Jeffrey A. DeVasher, Chair, TBA Appellate Practice Section R. Kreis White, Chair, TBA Tort & Insurance Practice Section Service List

Tennessee Bar Center
221 Fourth Avenue, North, Suite 400
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-2198
(615) 383-7421 • (800) 899-6993
FAX (615) 297-8058
www.tba.org

# DEC 3 0 2010 Clerk of the Courts Rec'd By

## IN THE SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE AT NASHVILLE

IN RE:	PROPOSED REPEAL OF RULE 37, RULES OF THE	)	No. M2010-02373-SC-RL2-RL
	TENNESSEE SUPREME	)	
	COURT	)	
		)	

#### COMMENT OF THE TENNESSEE BAR ASSOCIATION

The Tennessee Bar Association ("TBA"), by and through its President, Sam D. Elliott; General Counsel, William L. Harbison; Chair of its Appellate Practice Section, Jeffrey A. DeVasher; Chair of its Tort and Insurance Practice Section, R. Kreis White; and Executive Director, Allan F. Ramsaur, files this comment in support of the repeal of Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 37 establishing a mandatory mediation program for appeals in workers compensation cases.

On November 17, 2010, this Honorable Court ordered publication of a proposed repeal of Rule 37 of the Rules of the Tennessee Supreme Court. The comment deadline for this proposed repeal is Tuesday, January 18, 2011.

The Tennessee Bar Association requested comments from its Litigation, Tort and Insurance Practice, Appellate Practice and Dispute Resolution Sections regarding this proposal. The Appellate Practice and Tort and Insurance Practice Sections recommended repeal. This matter was considered by the TBA Executive Committee on Monday, December 13, 2010. The recommendation that the TBA support repeal of the rule was adopted.

While the adoption of the TN. Sup. Ct. R. 37 on mandatory appellate mediation was adopted prior to the provisions in TCA § 50-6-225(a) and would thus seem to duplicate the mediation process, the principal consideration behind the TBA's support for repeal of the rule is that mediations undertaken after a decision at the trial level seem to have limited utility because there has already been a decision. The party which prevailed below has little incentive to engage in meaningful mediation with the losing party.

For the foregoing reasons, the Tennessee Bar Association supports this repeal of the rule.

#### By: /s/ by permission

SAM D. ELLIOTT (009431)
President, Tennessee Bar Association
Gearhiser, Peters, Cavett, Elliott &
Cannon, PLLC
320 McCallie Avenue
Chattanooga, Tennessee 37402
(423) 756-5171

#### By: /s/ by permission

WILLIAM L. HARBISON (007012) General Counsel, Tennessee Bar Association Sherrard & Roe, PLC 424 Church Street, Suite 2000 Nashville, Tennessee 37219 (615) 742-4200

#### By: /s/ by permission

JEFFREY A. DEVASHER (11264)
Chair, Tennessee Bar Association
Appellate Practice Section
Metro Public Defenders Office
404 James Robertson Parkway, #2022
Nashville, Tennessee 37219
(615) 862-7285

R. KREIS WHITE (11264)

Chair, Tennessee Bar Association
Tort and Insurance Practice Section
White & Rhodes, PC
750 Old Hickory Boulevard, Suite 230
Brentwood, Tennessee 37027
(615) 309-0400

By

ALLAN F. RAMSAUR (5764)

Executive Director,
Tennessee Bar Association
Tennessee Bar Center
221 Fourth Avenue North, Suite 400
Nashville, Tennessee 37219-2198

#### CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE

(615) 383-7421

The undersigned certifies that a true and correct copy of the foregoing has been served upon the individuals and organizations identified in Exhibit "A" by regular U.S. Mail, postage prepaid within seven (7) days of filing with the Court.

Allan F. Ramsaur

#### **EXHIBIT A**

Adele Anderson Tennessee Board of Law Examiners 401 Church Street Suite 2200 Nashville TN 37243

John Cannon Memphis Bar Association 22 N. Front Street Suite 850 Memphis TN 38013 Melanie Gober Lawyers Association for Women P O Box 190583 Nashville TN 37219

Ursula Bailey William Henry Hastie Chapter - National Bar As 706 Walnut St Knoxville TN 37902

Hewitt Chatman Ballard-Taylor Bar Association 511 Algie Neely Rd Denmark TN 38391

Chris Guthrie Vanderbilt University School of Law 131 21st Ave. South Room 108 Nashville TN 37203

Beckman Lincoln Memorial University Duncan School of I 601 West Summit Hill Dr. Knoxville TN 37902

Erik Cole Tennessee Alliance for Legal Services 50 Vantage Way Suite 250 Nashville TN 37228 Wynne Hall ETLAW P. O. Box 198 900 S. Gay St. Ste. 2200 Knoxville TN 37901

Barri Bernstein Tennessee Bar Foundation 618 Church St Suite 120 Nashville TN 37219

Isaac Conner Tennessee Alliance for Black Lawyers 1223 5th Ave. N. Nashville TN 37208

Lynda Hood Chattanooga Bar Association 801 Broad St Suite 420 Pioneer Bldg Chattanooga TN 37402

Rebecca Blair Tennessee Lawyers Assn for Women 5214 Maryland Way Ste 207 Brentwood TN 37027 Walter Crouch Federal Bar Assn-Nashville Chapter P O Box 198966 511 Union St Suite 2700 Nashville TN 37219

Michele Howard-Flynn Association for Women Attorneys 3257 W. Sarazen's Circle Memphis TN 38125

Doug Blaze University of Tennessee College of Law 1505 W. Cumberland Ave Knoxville TN 37923

Barbara Deans Ben Jones Chapter - National Bar Association 365 Marianna Cove Memphis TN 38111

Nancy Jones Board of Professional Responsibility 10 Cadillac Drive SUite 220 Brentwood TN 37027

Leilani Boulware Lawyers Fund for Client Protection 4400 Franklin Rd. Nashville TN 37204

Laura Dykes TN Assn of Criminal Defense Lawyers 404 James Robertson Pky #2022 Nashville TN 37219 Suzanne Keith Tennessee Association for Justice 1903 Division St Nashville TN 37203

Beth Brooks East Shelby County Bar Assn 2299 Union Ave Memphis TN 38104

Anne Fritz Memphis Bar Association 80 Monroe Suite 220 Memphis TN 38103 Kaz Kikkawa Tennessee Asian Pacific American Bar As: c/o Branstetter, Stranch & Jennings, PLLC One Park Plaza 1-4-E Nashville TN 37203

Neil Brunetz Federal Bar Assn Chattanooga Chapter 832 Georgia Avenue Suite 1000 Chattanooga TN 37402

Michael Gabel Federal Bar Assn - Memphis Chapter 3620 Hacks Cross Rd Bldg B Fl2 Memphis TN 38125 Michael King Knoxville Bar Association PO Box 900 900 S. Gay St. Suite 900 Knoxville TN 37901 Jeff Kinsler Belmont University College of Law 1900 Belmont Blvd Nashville TN 37212

Ira Long Chattanooga Bar Association 1205 Tallan Building Two Union Square Chattanooga TN 37402

Ira Long Chattanooga Bar Association 1205 Tallan Building Two Union Square Chattanooga TN 37402

Joe Loser Nashville School of Law 4013 Armory Oaks Drive 600 Linden Square Nashville TN 37204

Bob Mendes Nashville Bar Association 2525 West End Ave Suite 1475 Nashville TN 37203

Jimmie Miller Tennessee Board of Law Examiners P O Box 3740 1212 N Eastman Rd Kingsport TN 37664

Phillip Miller Tennessee Association for Justice 631 Woodland St Nashville TN 37206

Mario Ramos TN Assn of Spanish Speaking Attnys 611 Commerce St Suite 3119 Nashville TN 37203

Allan Ramsaur Tennessee Bar Association 221 4th Ave N Suite 400 Nashville TN 37219 Chantelle Roberson S.L. Hutchins Chapter - National Bar Assn. 832 Georgia Avenue Ste 1000 Chattanooga TN 37402

Donna Roberts
Lawyers Assn for Women
Marion Griffin Rep
401 Commerce Street Ste 800
Nashville TN 37219

Amanda Rogers SETLAW P.O. Box 151 1110 Market St. Suite 500 Chattanooga TN 37401

Tom Scott Board of Professional Responsibility 550 W Main St Ste 601 Knoxville TN 37902

Dave Shearon Tennessee Commission CLE 6041 Frontier Ln 6041 Frontier Ln Nashville TN 37211

Barbara Short TN Assn of Criminal Defense Lawyers 121 21st Ave. N. Ste 311 Nashville TN 37203

Kevin Smith Cecil C. Humphreys School of Law 1 North Front St. Memphis TN 38103

Tessa Smith Tennessee Lawyers Assn for Women P. O. Box 331214 Nashville TN 37203

Melanie Stewart Tennessee Defense Lawyers Assn 9040 Garden Arbor Dr Ste 101 Germantown TN 38138 William Stover Napier-Looby Bar Assn 500 Church St Ste 450 Nashville TN 37219

Libby Sykes Administrative Offices of the Courts 511 Union St Suite 600 Nashville TN 37219

Brack Terry
Federal Bar Association NE TN Chapter
PO Box 724
918 W First North St
Morristown TN 37815

Dalton Townsend Tennessee Commission CLE PO Box 869 617 Main Street Knoxville TN 37901

Marsha Wilson Knoxville Bar Association P O Box 2027 505 Main St Suite 50 Knoxville TN 37901

Gigi Woodruff Nashville Bar Association 315 Union Street Suite 800 Nashville TN 37201 Hardin County Bar Assn

Kristie Anderson Campbell County Bar Assn PO Box 196 Jacksboro TN 37757

Beth Belew Paris-Henry County Bar Assn 200 N Poplar St Paris TN 38242

Mark Blakley Scott County Bar Assn P O Box 240 Huntsville TN 37756

Matt Bolton Washington County Bar Assn 104 East Main St Johnson City TN 37604

Lee Borthick Robertson County Bar Assn 117 5th Ave W. Springfield TN 37172

Ben Boston Lawrence County Bar Assn P O Box 357 235 Waterloo St Lawrenceburg TN 38464

Lee Bowles Marshall County Bar Assn 520 N Ellington Pkwy Lewisburg TN 37091

William Cockett Johnson County Bar Assn PO Box 108 Mountain City TN 37683

Daryl Colson Overton County Bar Assn 211 N Church St Livingston TN 38570 Steve Conley Obion County Bar Assn P O Box 427 317 S Third St Union City TN 38281

Bratten Cook Dekalb County Bar Assn

104 N 3rd St Smithville TN 37166

Dan Coughlin Bristol Bar Assn P.O. Box 1745 Bristol TN 37621

Terri Crider Gibson County Bar Assn P.O. Box 160 1302 Main Street Humboldt TN 38343

Robert Curtis Giles County Bar Assn P.O. Box 517 Pulaski TN 38478

Creed Daniel Grainger County Bar Assn P O Box 6 Courthouse Sq 115 Marshall Ave Rutledge TN 37861

Michael Davis Morgan County Bar Assn PO Box 925 Wartburg TN 37887

William Douglas Lauderdale County Bar Assn P O Box 489 109 N Main St Ripley TN 38063

Joseph Ford Franklin County Bar Assn 17 S College St Winchester TN 37398

Andrew Frazier
Benton County Bar Assn
P O Box 208
116 E Main
Camden TN 38320

Garrison Sumner County Bar Assn 103 Bluegrass Commons Blvd. Hendersonville TN 37075

Byron Gill Fifteenth Judical District Bar Assn 109 North Castle Heights Lebanon TN 37087

Michelle Green Hawkins County Bar Assn 307 S Depot St. Ste D 307 S Depot St. Ste D Rogersville TN 37857

Lindsay Gross Putnam County Bar Assn 100 South Jefferson Ave Cookeville TN 38501

Scott Hall Sevier County Bar Assn 105 Bruce St Sevierville TN 37862

Kim Helper Williamson County Bar Assn PO Box 937 21st Judicial Dist Franklin TN 37065

Wayne Henry Loudon County Bar Assn P O Box 366 322 Grove St Loudon TN 37774

Diane Hicks Blount County Bar Assn 101 W Broadway Ave Ste 208 Maryville TN 37801

Tim Hogan Rutherford-Cannon County Bar Assn 104 North Church St Murfreesboro TN 37130

Jason Holly Carter County Bar Assn 420 Railroad Street Elizabethton TN 37643 Carmon Hooper Haywood County Bar Assn P O Box 55 10 S Court Square Brownsville TN 38012

Carmon Hooper Haywood County Bar Assn P O Box 55 10 S Court Square Brownsville TN 38012

Caroline Knight
Cumberland County Bar Assn
28 W Fifth Street
Crossville TN 38555

Gregory Leffew Roane County Bar Assn PO Box 63 109 North Front Avenue Rockwood TN 37854

Matt Maddox Carroll County Bar Assn P O Box 827 19695 E Main St Huntingdon TN 38344

James McKenzie Twelfth Judicial District Bar Assn 1475 Market St Rm 202 Dayton TN 37321

William Mitchell White County Bar Assn 112 South Main Street Sparta TN 38583

Dalton Mounger Maury County Bar Assn PO Box 1468 808 South High St Columbia TN 38402

David Myers Union County Bar Assn P O Box 13 105 Monroe St Maynardville TN 37807

Janet Mynatt Anderson County Bar Assn PO Box 5209 Oak Ridge TN 37831 Timothy Naifeh Lake County Bar Assn 227 Church St Tiptonville TN 38079

Craig Northcott
Coffee County Bar Assn
1301 E. Carroll St.
Tullahoma TN 37388

Beau Pemberton Weakley County Bar Assn PO Box 789 Dresden TN 38225

Sheri Phillips Montgomery County Bar Assn PO Box 273 105 S Third St Clarksville TN 37040

Jody Pickens Jackson-Madison County Bar Assn PO Box 2825 Jackson TN 38302

Tim Potter
Dickson County Bar Assn
210 E. College St.
Dickson TN 37055

Will Roach Jefferson County Bar Assn 1004 N Hwy 92 Suite B 1004 N Hwy 92 Suite B Jefferson City TN 37760

Stevie Roller Warren County Bar Assn 111 W Court Sq Ste 1 McMinnville TN 37110

Curt Rose Kingsport Bar Assn PO Box 1404 537 E Center St Kingsport TN 37662

Mary Rutherford Hamblen County Bar Assn 400 W Main St Ste 304 Morristown TN 37814 Dora Salinas Cheatham County Bar Assn 104 Frey St 104 Frey St Ashland City TN 37015

Randall Self Lincoln County Bar Assn P O Box 501 131A E Market St Fayetteville TN 37334

Todd Shelton Greene County Bar Assn 100 S Main St Greeneville TN 37743

Lois Shults-Davis Unicoi County Bar Assn PO Box 129 111 Gay Street Erwin TN 37650

David Stanifer Claiborne County Bar Assn PO Box 217 1735 Main St Tazewell TN 37879

James Taylor Rhea County Bar Assn 1374 Railroad St Ste 400 Dayton TN 37321

Dwaine Thomas Monroe County Bar Assn PO Box 99 102 College St Madisonville TN 37354

Robert Thompson Bradley County Bar Assn P O Box 191 30 2nd St NW Cleveland TN 37364

Harriet Thompson Hardeman County Bar Assn P O Box 600 205 East Market St. Bolivar TN 38008

Billy Townsend Decatur, Lewis, Perry, Wayne Counties Bar Assn 26 West Linden Ave 26 West Linden Ave Hohenwald TN 38462 John White Bedford County Bar Assn P O Box 169 111 North Spring St Ste 202 Shelbyville TN 37162

Derreck Whitson Cocke County Bar Assn P.O. Box 1230 311 East Broadway Newport TN 37822

John Lee Williams Humphreys County Bar Assn 102 S Court Square 102 South Court Square Waverly TN 37185

Matthew Willis Dyer County Bar Assn PO Box H 322 Church Ave. N. Dyersburg TN 38025

Tish Wilsdorf Hickman County Bar Assn 820 Hwy 100 121 Cabin Dr. Centerville TN 37033

Donald Winder McMinn-Meigs County Bar Assn PO Box 628 10 W Madison Ave Athens TN 37371

Barney Witherington Tipton County Bar Assn P O Box 922 205 S Main Street Covington TN 38019