

## APPENDIX A

### 1. AMENDED RULE 13

(Effective July 1, 2004 unless another effective date is provided herein)

Section 1. Right to counsel and procedure for appointment of counsel.

(a)(1) The purposes of this rule are:

(A) to provide for the appointment of counsel in all proceedings in which an indigent party has a statutory or constitutional right to appointed counsel;

(B) to provide for compensation of appointed counsel in non-capital cases;

(C) to establish qualifications and provide for compensation of appointed counsel in capital cases, including capital post-conviction proceedings;

(D) to provide for payment of expenses incident to appointed counsel's representation;

(E) to provide for the appointment and compensation of experts, investigators, and other support services for indigent parties in criminal cases, parental rights termination proceedings, dependency and neglect proceedings, delinquency proceedings, and capital post-conviction proceedings;

(F) to establish procedures for review of claims for compensation and reimbursement of expenses; and

(G) to meet the standards set forth in Section 107 of the Antiterrorism and Effective Death Penalty Act of 1996.

(2) The failure of any court to follow the provisions of this rule shall not constitute grounds for relief from a judgment of conviction or sentence. The failure of appointed counsel to meet the qualifications set forth in this rule shall not be deemed evidence that counsel did not provide effective assistance of counsel in a particular case.

(b) Each trial court exercising criminal jurisdiction shall maintain a roster of attorneys from which appointments will be made. However, a court may appoint attorneys whose names are not on the roster if necessary to obtain competent counsel according to the provisions of this rule.

(c) All general sessions, juvenile, trial, and appellate courts shall appoint counsel to represent indigent defendants and other parties who have a constitutional or statutory right to representation (herein "indigent party" or "defendant") according to the procedures and standards set forth in this rule.

(d)(1) In the following cases, and in all other cases required by law, the court or appointing authority shall advise any party without counsel of the right to be represented throughout the case by counsel and that counsel will be appointed if the party is indigent and requests appointment of counsel.

(A) Cases in which an adult is charged with a felony or a misdemeanor and is in jeopardy of incarceration;

(B) Contempt of court proceedings in which the defendant is in jeopardy of incarceration;

(C) Proceedings initiated by a petition for *habeas corpus*, early release from incarceration, suspended sentence, or probation revocation;

(D) Proceedings initiated by a petition for post-conviction relief, subject to the provisions of Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 28 and Tennessee Code Annotated sections 40-30-101 et seq.;

(E) Parole revocation proceedings pursuant to the authority of state and/or federal law;

(F) Judicial proceedings under Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 33, Chapters 3 through 8, Mental Health Law;

(G) Cases in which a superintendent of a mental health facility files a petition under the guardianship law, Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 34; and

(H) Cases under Tennessee Code Annotated section 37-10-304 and Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 24, relative to petitions for waiver of parental consent for abortions by minors.

(2) In the following proceedings, and in all other proceedings where required by law, the court or appointing authority shall advise any party without counsel of the right to be represented throughout the case by counsel and that counsel will be appointed if the party is indigent and, except as provided in (C) and (D) below, requests appointment of counsel.

(A) Cases in which a juvenile is charged with juvenile delinquency for committing an act which would be a misdemeanor or a felony if committed by an adult;

(B) Cases under Titles 36 and 37 of the Tennessee Code Annotated involving allegations against parents that could result in finding a child dependent or neglected or in terminating parental rights;

(C) Reports of abuse or neglect or investigation reports under Tennessee Code Annotated sections 37-1-401 through 37-1-411. The court shall appoint a guardian ad litem for every child who is or may be the subject of such report. The appointment of the guardian ad litem shall be made upon the filing of the petition or upon the court's own motion, based upon knowledge or reasonable belief that the child may have been abused or neglected. The child who is or may be the subject of a report or investigation of abuse or neglect shall not be required to request appointment of counsel. A single guardian ad litem shall be appointed to represent an entire sibling group unless the court finds that conflicting interests require the appointment of more than one guardian. For purposes of this subsection, the compensation limits established in section 2 apply to each guardian ad litem appointed rather than to each child.

(D) Proceedings to terminate parental rights. The court shall appoint a guardian ad litem for the child, unless the termination is uncontested. The child who is or may be the subject of proceedings to terminate parental rights shall not be required to request appointment of counsel. A single guardian ad litem shall be appointed to represent an entire sibling group unless the court finds that conflicting interests require the appointment of more than one guardian. For purposes of this subsection, the compensation limits established in section 2 apply to each guardian ad litem appointed rather than to each child.

(E) Cases in which a juvenile is charged upon three (3) or more court proceedings to be unruly as defined in Tennessee Code Annotated section 37-1-126(a).

(e) (1) Except in cases under Sections 1(d)(1)(F) proceedings under the mental health law, 1(d)(1)(G) proceedings for guardianship under Title 34, and 1(d)(2)(A) juvenile delinquency proceedings, whenever a party to any case in section 1(d) requests the appointment of counsel,

the party shall be required to complete and submit to the court an Affidavit of Indigency Form provided by the Administrative Office of the Courts, herein "AOC".

(2) Upon inquiry, the court shall make a finding as to the indigency of the party pursuant to the provisions of Tennessee Code Annotated section 40-14-202, which finding shall be evidenced by a court order.

(3) Upon finding a party indigent, the court shall enter an order appointing counsel unless the indigent party rejects the offer of appointment of counsel with an understanding of the legal consequences of the rejection.

(4) (A) When appointing counsel for an indigent defendant pursuant to section 1(e)(3), the court shall appoint the district public defender's office, the state post-conviction defender's office, or other attorneys employed by the state for indigent defense (herein "public defender") if qualified pursuant to this rule and no conflict of interest exists, unless in the sound discretion of the trial judge appointment of other counsel is necessary. Appointment of public defenders shall be subject to the limitations of Tennessee Code Annotated sections 8-14-201 et seq.

(B) If a conflict of interest exists as provided in Tennessee Rules of Professional Conduct 1.7 or the public defender is not qualified pursuant to this rule, the court shall designate counsel from the roster of private attorneys maintained pursuant to section 1(b).

(C) The court shall appoint separate counsel for indigent defendants having interests that cannot be represented properly by the same counsel or when other good cause is shown.

(D) The court shall not make an appointment if counsel makes a clear and convincing showing that adding the appointment to counsel's current workload would prevent counsel from rendering effective representation in accordance with constitutional and professional standards.

(E) When the court appoints counsel pursuant to this subsection, the order of appointment shall assess the non-refundable administrative fee provided by Tennessee Code Annotated section 37-1-126(c)(1) or section 40-14-103(b)(1). Additionally the court shall consider the financial ability of the indigent party to defray a portion or all of the cost for representation by the public defender or a portion or all of the costs associated with the provision of court appointed counsel as provided by Tennessee Code Annotated sections 8-14-205(d)(1); 37-1-126(c)(2); or, 40-14-103(b)(2). If the court finds the indigent party is financially able to defray a portion or all the cost of the indigent party's representation, the court shall enter an order directing the indigent party to pay into the registry of the clerk of such court such sum as the court determines the indigent party is able to pay as specified by Tennessee Code Annotated section 40-14-202(e).

(5) Appointed counsel shall continue to represent an indigent party throughout the proceedings, including any appeals, until the case has been concluded or counsel has been allowed to withdraw by a court. See Tenn. Sup. Ct. R. 14 (setting out the procedure for withdrawal in the Court of Appeals and Court of Criminal Appeals); Tenn. Sup. Ct. R. 8, RPC 1.16.

(f) (1) Indigent parties shall not have the right to select appointed counsel. If an indigent party refuses to accept the services of appointed counsel, such refusal shall be in writing and shall be signed by the indigent party in the presence of the court.

(2) The court shall acknowledge thereon the signature of the indigent party and make the written refusal a part of the record in the case. In addition, the court shall satisfy all other applicable constitutional and procedural requirements relating to waiver of the right to counsel. The indigent party may act pro se without the assistance or presence of counsel only after the court has fulfilled all lawful obligations relating to waiver of the right to counsel.

*Explanatory Comment: Section 1(e)(1) has been revised for simplicity and organization. Section 1(e)(2) emphasizes that the finding of indigency must be evidenced by a court order. Section 1(e)(4)(A) is stricter than the former rule and emphasizes that trial courts “shall” appoint the public defender to represent criminal defendants unless a conflict of interest exists or in the sound discretion of the trial court, appointment of another counsel is necessary. Section 1(e)(4)(D) includes a specific standard that must be satisfied before counsel may refuse an appointment. Section 1(e)(4)(E) emphasizes that courts have a statutory duty to assess the administrative fee when appointing counsel as well as a statutory duty to consider whether the indigent party can afford to defray a portion or all of the costs of representation. Section 1(e)(5) clarifies that appointed counsel is obligated to represent the indigent party until a court allows counsel to withdraw. Section 1(f) delineates the rights of indigent parties and the obligations of courts when an indigent party chooses to proceed without counsel.*

Section 2. Compensation of counsel in non-capital cases.

(a)(1) Appointed counsel, other than public defenders, shall be entitled to reasonable compensation for services rendered as provided in this rule. Reasonable compensation shall be determined by the court in which services are rendered, subject to the limitations in this rule, which limitations are declared to be reasonable.

(2) These limitations apply to compensation for services rendered in each court: municipal, juvenile, or general sessions; criminal, circuit, or chancery; Court of Appeals or Court of Criminal Appeals; Tennessee Supreme Court; and United States Supreme Court.

(b) Co-counsel or associate attorneys in non-capital cases shall not be compensated.

(c) (1) The hourly rate for appointed counsel in non-capital cases shall not exceed forty dollars (\$40) per hour for time reasonably spent in trial preparation and fifty dollars (\$50) per hour for time reasonably spent in court.

(2) For purposes of this rule, “time reasonably spent in trial preparation” means time spent preparing the case to which the attorney has been appointed to represent the indigent party. “Time reasonably spent in court” means time spent before a judge on the case to which the attorney has been appointed to represent the indigent party.

(d) (1) The maximum compensation allowed shall be determined by the original charge or allegations in the case. Except as provided in section 2(e), the compensation allowed appointed counsel for services rendered in a non-capital case shall not exceed the following amounts:

(2) Five hundred dollars (\$500) for:

(A) Cases in which an adult or a juvenile is charged with a misdemeanor and is in jeopardy of incarceration;

(B) Contempt of court cases where an adult or a juvenile is in jeopardy of incarceration;

(C) Parole revocation proceedings pursuant to the authority of state and/or federal law;

(D) Judicial proceedings under Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 33, Chapters 3 through 8, Mental Health Law;

(E) Cases in which a superintendent of a mental health facility files a petition under the guardianship law, Tennessee Code Annotated, Title 34;

(F) Cases under Tennessee Code Annotated section 37-10-304 and Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 24, relative to petitions for waiver of parental consent for abortions by minors;

(G) Cases in which a juvenile is charged upon three (3) or more court proceedings to be unruly as defined in Tennessee Code Annotated section 37-1-126(a);

(3) One thousand dollars (\$1,000) for:

(A) Preliminary hearings in general sessions and municipal courts in which an adult is charged with a felony;

(B) Cases in trial courts in which the defendant is charged with a felony;

(C) Direct and interlocutory appeals in the Court of Appeals or Court of Criminal Appeals;

(D) Direct and interlocutory appeals in the Tennessee Supreme Court;

(E) Cases in which a defendant is applying for early release from incarceration or a suspended sentence;

(F) Non-capital post-conviction and *habeas corpus* proceedings;

(G) Probation revocation proceedings;

(H) Cases in which a juvenile is charged with a non-capital felony;

(I) All other non-capital cases in which the indigent party has a statutory or constitutional right to be represented by counsel.

(4) Maximum compensation for juvenile dependency and neglect proceedings and termination of parental rights proceedings is as follows:

(A) Five hundred dollars (\$500) for:

(i) Dependent or neglected child cases, from the filing of the dependency petition through the dispositional hearing, including the preliminary hearing, ratification of the initial permanency plan, adjudicatory and dispositional hearings;

(ii) Guardian ad litem representation in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(C) for a child or sibling group who is or may be the subject of a report of abuse or neglect or an investigation report under Tennessee Code Annotated sections 37-1-401 through 37-1-411, from the filing of the

dependency petition through the dispositional hearing, including the preliminary hearing, ratification of the initial permanency plan, adjudicatory and dispositional hearings;

(iii) Counsel appointed pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 40(e)(2) and in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(C) for a child or sibling group who is or may be the subject of a report of abuse or neglect or an investigation report under Tennessee Code Annotated sections 37-1-401 through 37-1-411, from the filing of the dependency petition through the dispositional hearing, including the preliminary hearing, ratification of the initial permanency plan, adjudicatory and dispositional hearings;

(B) Seven hundred and fifty dollars (\$750) for:

(i) Dependent or neglected child cases, for all post-dispositional proceedings, including foster care review board hearings, post-dispositional court reviews and permanency hearings;

(ii) Guardian ad litem representation in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(C) for a child or sibling group who is or may be the subject of a report of abuse or neglect or an investigation report under Tennessee Code Annotated sections 37-1-401 through 37-1-411, for all post-dispositional proceedings, including foster care review board hearings, post-dispositional court reviews, and permanency hearings;

(iii) Counsel appointed pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 40(e)(2) and in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(D) for a child or sibling group who is or may be the subject of a report of abuse or neglect or an investigation report under Tennessee Code Annotated sections 37-1-401 through 37-1-411, for all post-dispositional proceedings, including foster care review board hearings, post-dispositional court reviews, and permanency hearings.

(C) One thousand dollars (\$1000) for:

(i) Proceedings against parents in which allegations against the parents could result in termination of parental rights;

(ii) Guardian ad litem representation in termination of parental rights cases in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(D);

(iii) Counsel appointed pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 40(e)(2) and in accordance with section 1(d)(2)(C) for a child or sibling group in termination of parental rights cases;

(e) (1) Notwithstanding the provisions of section (2)(d), an amount in excess of the maximum, subject to the limitations of section (2)(e)(3), may be sought by filing a motion in the court in which representation is provided. The motion shall include specific factual allegations demonstrating that the case is complex or extended in accordance with Tennessee Code Annotated section 40-14-207(a)(2). The court shall enter an order which evidences the action taken on the motion. The following, while neither controlling nor exclusive, indicate the character of reasons that may support a complex or extended certification:

(A) The case involved complex scientific evidence and/or expert testimony;

(B) The case involved multiple defendants and/or numerous witnesses;

(C) The case involved multiple protracted hearings;

(D) The case involved novel and complex legal issues.

(E) If the motion is granted, an order shall be forwarded to the Director of the AOC (herein “director”) certifying the case as complex or extended. The order shall either recite the specific facts supporting the finding or incorporate by reference and attach the motion which includes the specific facts supporting the finding. To qualify for payment under this section, the order certifying the claim as extended or complex must be signed contemporaneously with the court’s approval of the claim. *Nunc pro tunc* certification orders are not sufficient to support payment under this section.

(2) All payments under section 2(e)(1) must be submitted to the director for approval. If a payment under section 2(e)(1) is not approved by the director, the director shall transmit the claim to the chief justice for disposition. The determination of the chief justice shall be final.

(3) Upon approval of the complex or extended claim by the director or the chief justice, the following maximum amounts apply:

(A) One thousand dollars (\$1,000) in those categories of cases where the maximum compensation is otherwise five hundred dollars (\$500);

(B) One thousand, five hundred dollars (\$1,500) in those categories of cases where the maximum compensation is otherwise seven hundred and fifty dollars (\$750);

(C) Except as provided in section (2)(e)(3)(D), two thousand dollars (\$2,000) in those categories of cases where the maximum compensation is otherwise one thousand dollars (\$1,000);

(D) Three thousand dollars (\$3,000) in cases in trial courts in which the defendant is charged with a felony. Where the felony charged is first-degree murder, the director may waive the three thousand dollar (\$3,000) maximum if the order demonstrates that extraordinary circumstances exist and failure to waive the maximum would result in undue hardship.

(f) Attorneys shall not be compensated for time associated with traveling to a court in another county for the sole purpose of hand-delivering or filing a document.

*Explanatory Comment: Section 2(b) unequivocally provides that only one attorney will be compensated in non-capital cases. Section 2(c) clarifies that appointed counsel will not be paid in-court rates for time spent waiting for a case to be called and that appointed counsel will not be compensated for time spent on Board of Professional Responsibility complaints arising from appointments. Section 2(d) has been reorganized for simplicity and clarity. Compensation rates for counsel appointed in juvenile, dependency and neglect, and termination of parental rights cases are now contained in Section 2(d)(4). Section 2(d)(4) further defines the dispositional and post-dispositional phases at which compensation is appropriate and also compensates attorneys appointed pursuant to Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 40(e)(2). Section 2(d)(4)(B) increases the maximum compensation for appointed counsel in certain post-dispositional proceedings from*

*\$500 to \$750. Section 2(e)(1) further delineates the procedure and factors supporting certification of a case as complex or extended, including the mandatory requirement that the order certifying the claim be submitted to the AOC contemporaneously with the claim requesting complex or extended compensation. Section 2(e)(2) reiterates that approval of the director or the chief justice is required and that the determination of the chief justice is final. Section 6 of this rule sets out in more detail the claims review process. Section 2(e)(3)(A)-(C) has been revised to simplify and clarify the language. Section 2(e)(3)(D) has been revised to limit waiver of the \$3,000 maximum to first-degree murder cases, rather than all homicide cases. Section 2(f) precludes compensating attorneys for time spent traveling to and from a clerk's office in another county for the sole purpose of hand-delivering or filing documents.*

### Section 3. Minimum qualifications and compensation of counsel in capital cases.

(a) For purposes of this rule, a capital case is a case in which a defendant has been charged with first-degree murder and a notice of intent to seek the death penalty, as provided in Tennessee Code Annotated section 39-13-208 and Tennessee Rule of Criminal Procedure 12.3(b), has been filed and no order withdrawing the notice has been filed. Non-capital compensation rates apply to services rendered by appointed counsel after the date the notice of intent to seek the death penalty is withdrawn.

(b) (1) The court shall appoint two attorneys to represent a defendant at trial in a capital case. Both attorneys appointed must be licensed in Tennessee and have significant experience in Tennessee criminal trial practice, unless in the sound discretion of the trial court, appointment of one attorney admitted under Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 19 is appropriate. The appointment order shall specify which attorney is "lead counsel" and which attorney is "co-counsel." Whenever possible, a public defender shall serve as and be designated "lead counsel."

(2) If the notice of intent to seek the death penalty is withdrawn at least thirty (30) days prior to trial, the trial court shall enter an order relieving one of the attorneys previously appointed. In these circumstances, the trial court may grant the defendant, upon motion, a reasonable continuance of the trial.

(3) If the notice is withdrawn less than thirty (30) days prior to trial, the trial court may either enter an order authorizing the two attorneys previously appointed to remain on the case for the duration of the present trial, or enter an order relieving one of the attorneys previously appointed and granting the defendant, upon motion, a reasonable continuance of the trial.

(c) Lead counsel must:

(1) be a member in good standing of the Tennessee bar or be admitted to practice *pro hac vice*;

(2) have regularly participated in criminal jury trials for at least five years;

(3) have completed, prior to the appointment, a minimum of six (6) hours of specialized training in the defense of defendants charged with a capital offense; and, complete a minimum of six (6) hours of specialized training in the defense of defendants charged with a capital offense every two years thereafter;



(4) have at least one of the following:

(A) experience as lead counsel in the jury trial of at least one capital case;

(B) experience as co-counsel in the trial of at least two capital cases;

(C) experience as co-counsel in the trial of a capital case and experience as lead or sole counsel in the jury trial of at least one murder case;

(D) experience as lead counsel or sole counsel in at least three murder jury trials or one murder jury trial and three felony jury trials; or

(E) experience as a judge in the jury trial of at least one capital case.

(5) The provisions of this subsection requiring lead counsel to have participated in criminal jury trials for at least five years, rather than three years, and requiring six (6) hours of specialized training shall become effective January 1, 2006.

(d) Co-counsel must:

(1) be a member in good standing of the Tennessee bar or be admitted to practice *pro hac vice*;

(2) have completed, prior to the appointment, a minimum of six (6) hours of specialized training in the defense of defendants charged with a capital offense; and, complete a minimum of six (6) hours of specialized training in the defense of defendants charged with a capital offense every two years thereafter;

(3) have at least one of the following qualifications:

(A) qualify as lead counsel under (c) above; or

(B) have experience as sole counsel, lead counsel, or co-counsel in a murder jury trial.

(4) The provisions of this subsection requiring six (6) hours of specialized training shall become effective January 1, 2006.

(e) Attorneys who represent the defendant in the trial court in a capital case may be designated to represent the defendant on direct appeal, provided at least one trial attorney qualifies as new appellate counsel under section 3(g) of this rule and both attorneys are available for appointment. However, new counsel will be appointed to represent the defendant if the trial court, or the court in which the case is pending, determines that appointment of new counsel is necessary to provide the defendant with effective assistance of counsel or that the best interest of the defendant requires appointment of new counsel.

(f) If new counsel are appointed to represent the defendant on direct appeal, both attorneys appointed must be licensed in Tennessee, unless in the sound discretion of the judge, appointment of one attorney admitted under Tennessee Supreme Court Rule 19 is appropriate.

(g) Appointed counsel on direct appeal, regardless of any prior representation of the defendant, must have three years of litigation experience in criminal trials and appeals, and they must have at least one of the two following requirements: experience as counsel of record in the appeal of a capital case; or experience as counsel of record in the appeal of at least three felony convictions

within the past three years and a minimum of six hours of specialized training in the trial and appeal of capital cases.

(h) Counsel eligible to be appointed as post-conviction counsel in capital cases must have the same qualifications as appointed appellate counsel, or have trial and appellate experience as counsel of record in state post-conviction proceedings in three felony cases, two homicide cases, or one capital case. Counsel also must have a working knowledge of federal *habeas corpus* practice, which may be satisfied by six hours of specialized training in the representation in federal courts of defendants under the sentence of death imposed in state courts; and they must not have previously represented the defendant at trial or on direct appeal in the case for which the appointment is made, unless the defendant and counsel expressly consent to continued representation.

(i) No more than two attorneys shall be appointed to represent a death-row inmate in a proceeding regarding competency for execution. See *Van Tran v. State*, 6 S.W.3d 257 (Tenn. 1999). At least one of the attorneys appointed shall be qualified as post-conviction counsel as set forth in section 3(h).

(j) Appointed counsel in capital cases, other than public defenders, shall be entitled to reasonable compensation as determined by the court in which such services are rendered, subject to the limitations of this rule, which limitations are declared to be reasonable. Compensation shall be limited to the two attorneys actually appointed in the case. Appointed counsel in a capital case shall submit claims in accordance with Section 6 of this rule.

(k) Hourly rates for appointed counsel in capital cases shall be as follows:

(1) Lead counsel out-of-court--seventy-five dollars (\$75);

(2) Lead counsel in-court--one hundred dollars (\$100);

(3) Co-counsel out-of-court--sixty dollars (\$60);

(4) Co-counsel in-court--eighty dollars (\$80);

(5) Post-conviction counsel out-of-court--sixty dollars (\$60);

(6) Post-conviction counsel in-court--eighty dollars (\$80);

(7) Counsel appointed pursuant to section 3(i) out-of-court--sixty dollars (\$60);

(8) Counsel appointed pursuant to section 3(i) in-court--eighty dollars (\$80).

(l) For purposes of this rule, "out-of-court" means time reasonably spent working on the case to which the attorney has been appointed to represent the indigent party. "In-court" means time spent before a judge on the case to which the attorney has been appointed to represent the indigent party.

(m) Attorneys shall not be compensated for time associated with traveling to a court in another county for the sole purpose of hand-delivering or filing a document.

*Explanatory Comment: Section 3(a) clarifies that even if a trial court allows two appointed attorneys to remain on a case, under Section 3(b)(3), after a notice of intent to seek the death penalty is withdrawn, counsel will be compensated at non-capital rates for services rendered after the date the notice is withdrawn. Section 3(b)(1) has been revised to require that the appointment order must specify lead and co-counsel and that the public defender must serve and be designated lead counsel whenever possible. Section 3(b)(2) & (3) previously appeared as Section 3(l) of Rule 13. Section 3 now permits former prosecutors and judges with appropriate experience to be appointed counsel in capital cases. Section 3(c)(2) has been revised to require five years participation in criminal jury trials, rather than three years representation of defendants in criminal jury trials. Section 3(c)(3) has been revised to enhance the educational requirements for appointed counsel. Section 3(c)(4)(E) has been revised to include an experience requirement applicable only to former judges. Section 3(i) has been revised to clarify that its scope is limited to affording compensation to appointed counsel in a proceeding challenging the inmate's competency to be executed. Section 3(k)(7) & (8) provides that attorneys appointed in competency proceedings will be compensated at the same \$60/\$80 rates applicable in other capital post-conviction proceedings. Section 3(l) precludes compensating appointed counsel at in-court rates for time spent waiting for a case to be called and also precludes compensating appointed counsel for time spent defending against a Board of Professional Responsibility action that arises from the appointment. Section 3(m) precludes compensating attorneys for time spent driving to and from a clerk's office in another county for the sole purpose of hand-delivering or filing a document.*

#### Section 4. Payment of expenses incident to representation.

(a) (1) Appointed counsel, experts, and investigators may be reimbursed for certain necessary expenses directly related to the representation of indigent parties.

(2) The services or time of a paralegal, law clerk, secretary, legal assistant, or other administrative assistants shall not be reimbursed. Normal overhead expenses also shall not be reimbursed.

(3) The following expenses will be reimbursed without prior approval if reasonably necessary to the representation of the indigent party:

(A) Long distance telephone charges, if supported by a log showing the date of the call, the person or office called, the purpose of the call, and the duration of the call stated in one-tenth (1/10) hour segments;

(B) Mileage for travel within the state in accordance with Judicial Department travel regulations, if supported by a log showing the mileage, the purpose of the travel, and the origination and destination cities;

(C) Lodging where an overnight stay is required at actual costs, if supported by a receipt, not to exceed the current authorized executive branch rates;

For in-state rates: [www.state.tn.us/finance/act/travel.html](http://www.state.tn.us/finance/act/travel.html)

For out-of-state rates: [www.state.tn.us/finance/act/policy.html](http://www.state.tn.us/finance/act/policy.html)

(D) Meals in accordance with the Judicial Department travel regulations if supported by a receipt, where an overnight stay is required;

(E) Parking at actual costs up to ten dollars per day if supported by a receipt;

(F) Photocopying - Black and White Copies -

(i) In-house copying at a rate not to exceed seven cents (\$0.07) per page;

(ii) Actual cost of outsourced copying if supported by a receipt, at a rate not to exceed ten cents (\$0.10) per page;

(iii) Actual cost of providing to client a copy of appellate briefs and opinion.

(iv) The cost of providing to the indigent party a copy of the court file or transcript will not be reimbursed once the appeal is complete because the original file and transcript belong to the client.

(v) Prior approval of the court and the director is required if an attorney, expert, or investigator anticipates that total copying costs will exceed \$500.

(G) Photocopying - Color Copies -

(i) In-house color copying at a rate not to exceed one dollar (\$1.00) per page;

(ii) Actual cost of outsourced color copies at a rate not to exceed \$1.00 per page if supported by a receipt;

(iii) Prior approval of the court and the director is required if an attorney, expert, or investigator anticipates that total copying costs will exceed \$500.

(H) Computerized Research at actual cost for case-related legal and internet research if supported by receipts. If actual costs are not incurred, compensation will be limited to time spent conducting the search. Pro rata cost of subscription[s] will not be paid.

(I) Miscellaneous expenses such as postage, commercial delivery service having computer tracking capacity, film, or printing will be compensated at actual cost, not to exceed the fair and reasonable market value, if accompanied by a receipt. Prior approval of the court and the director is required if an attorney, expert, or investigator anticipates that total miscellaneous expenses will exceed \$250.

(J) Expenses relating to improving the indigent party's appearance, including but not limited to expenses for dental plates, haircuts, clothing and cleaning charges for clothing, are not

reimbursable.

(b) Expenses not listed in section 4(a), including travel outside the state, will be reimbursed only if prior authorization is obtained from the court in which the representation is rendered and prior approval is obtained from the director.

(1) Authorization of expenses shall be sought by motion to the court.

(2) The motion shall include both an itemized statement of the estimated or anticipated costs and specific factual allegations demonstrating that the expenses are directly related to and necessary for the effective representation of the indigent party.

(3) The court shall enter an order that evidences the action taken on the motion. If the motion is granted, the order shall either recite the specific facts demonstrating that the expenses are directly related to and necessary for the effective representation of the indigent party or incorporate by reference and attach the defense motion that includes the specific facts demonstrating that finding.

(4) The order and any attachments shall be submitted to the director for prior approval before any expenses are incurred.

(c) The director is hereby authorized to reimburse the Department of Children's Services at the Judicial Department rate for the expense of transcripts in termination of parental rights appeals without obtaining prior approval by court order in each case.

(d) Spoken Foreign Language Interpreters and Translators

(1) The reasonable costs associated with an interpreter's and/or translator's services will be compensated when a trial court finds, upon motion of counsel or *sua sponte*, that an indigent party has limited English proficiency ("LEP"). The term "interpret" refers to the process of transmitting the spoken word from one language to another. The term "translate" refers to the process of transmitting the written word from one language to another.

(2) This section, rather than Tennessee Rule of Criminal Procedure 28, applies when an indigent party requires the services of a foreign language interpreter or translator. When it is necessary for a court to utilize the services of an interpreter to determine if an individual with LEP is indigent, the AOC will compensate the interpreter for this service. If the court ultimately determines that the individual is not indigent, all other interpreter services must be billed as court costs pursuant to Tennessee Rule of Criminal Procedure 28 or Tennessee Rule of Civil Procedure 54.04.

(3) Compensation rates for services provided by spoken foreign language interpreters shall not exceed the following: Certified Interpreter - \$50 per hour; Registered Interpreter - \$40 per hour; Non-Credentialed Interpreter - \$25 per hour. If the court finds that these rates are inadequate to secure the services of a qualified interpreter in a language other than Spanish, the court shall make written findings regarding such inadequacy and determine a reasonable rate for a qualified interpreter.

(4) The court shall determine if it is reasonably necessary for documents to be translated as part of assuring adequate representation of an indigent party with LEP. Document translation shall be

compensated at a rate of twenty cents (\$0.20) per word. If the court finds that this rate is inadequate to secure the services of a qualified translator, the court shall make written findings regarding such inadequacy and determine a reasonable per-word translation rate.

(5) Services associated with the review or transcription/translation of audio or video tapes that include languages other than English shall be compensated at the same rate provided for spoken foreign language interpreters in Section 4(d)(3).

(6) Interpreters shall be compensated for a minimum of two (2) hours per day when providing in-court interpretation. Compensation for interpreters or translators shall not exceed the following: Certified Interpreter - \$500 per day; Registered Interpreter - \$400 per day; Non-Credentialed Interpreter - \$250 per day.

(7) Mileage, lodging, meals, and parking expenses may be reimbursed as provided in Section 4(a)(3)(B), (C), (D), and (E). Time spent traveling shall be compensated at the same rates provided for spoken foreign language interpreters in Section 4(d)(3).

(8) If the court approves an amount in excess of five thousand dollars (\$5,000) for interpreter/translator services, the order(s) and any attachments must be submitted to the director for prior approval. If the director denies prior approval of the request, the claim shall be transmitted to the chief justice for disposition. The determination of the chief justice shall be final.

(9) Claims for compensation of interpreters and translators shall be submitted by interpreters to the AOC on forms provided by the AOC. The forms must be signed by either the court or counsel. The interpreter's submission to the AOC must also include a copy of the court's order appointing the interpreter/translator.

(10) To facilitate the prompt and efficient disposition of proceedings which involve individuals with LEP, counties may wish to utilize credentialed interpreters on a full-time or part-time basis. If a county does so, the AOC will reimburse the county for those services for which an interpreter would be entitled to compensation pursuant to this rule. The rate of compensation will depend upon the rate at which the county routinely compensates the interpreter, but under no circumstances will the compensation exceed the rates provided for in this rule. Counties wishing to be reimbursed for these expenses shall contact the AOC, which will determine in what amounts and by what method said reimbursement shall be made.

*Explanatory Comment: Section 4(a) provides uniform guidelines and certainty as to expenses that will be reimbursed and delineates the documentation that must accompany a claim for reimbursement. Section 4(a)(3) permits reimbursement without prior approval of certain expenses and is intended to eliminate time previously spent by attorneys and judges considering such expenses. Section 4(a)(3)(F)(iv) clarifies that attorneys will not be reimbursed for the costs of copying the record since the record belongs to the indigent party. Section 4(b) delineates the expenses for which prior approval is required and sets out the requirements and procedure for obtaining prior approval. Section 4(b) dispenses with the former requirement that prior approval be obtained from both the director and the chief justice and makes prior approval of the director essential and final. Section 4(d) provides the mechanism and method for compensating spoken foreign language interpreters and translators. Section (4)(d)(10) provides*

*a mechanism for reimbursing counties that choose to utilize credentialed interpreters on a full-time or part-time basis.*

Section 5. Experts, investigators, and other support services.

(a) (1) In the trial and direct appeal of all criminal cases in which the defendant is entitled to appointed counsel and in the trial and appeals of post-conviction proceedings in capital cases involving indigent petitioners, the court, in an *ex parte* hearing, may in its discretion determine that investigative or expert services or other similar services are necessary to ensure that the constitutional rights of the defendant are properly protected. If such determination is made, the court may grant prior authorization for these necessary services in a reasonable amount to be determined by the court. The authorization shall be evidenced by a signed order of the court. The order shall provide for the payment or reimbursement of reasonable and necessary expenses by the director. See Tenn. Code Ann. § 40-14-207(b); *State v. Barnett*, 909 S.W.2d 423 (Tenn. 1995); *Owens v. State*, 908 S.W.2d 923 (Tenn. 1995).

(2) In non-capital post-conviction proceedings, funding for investigative, expert, or other similar services shall not be authorized or approved. See *Davis v. State*, 912 S.W.2d 689 (Tenn. 1995).

(b) (1) Every effort shall be made to obtain the services of a person or entity whose primary office of business is within 150 miles of the court where the case is pending. If the person or entity proposed to provide the service is not located within the 150-mile radius, the motion shall explain the efforts made to obtain the services of a provider within the 150-mile radius.

(2) Any motion seeking funding for expert or similar services shall itemize:

(A) the nature of the services requested;

(B) the name, address, qualifications, and licensure status, as evidenced by a curriculum vitae or resume, of the person or entity proposed to provide the services;

(C) the means, date, time, and location at which the services are to be provided; and

(D) a statement of the itemized costs of the services, including the hourly rate, and the amount of any expected additional or incidental costs.

(3) Any motion seeking funding for investigative or other similar services shall itemize:

(A) the type of investigation to be conducted;

(B) the specific facts that suggest the investigation likely will result in admissible evidence;

(C) an itemized list of anticipated expenses for the investigation;

(D) the name and address of the person or entity proposed to provide the services; and

(E) a statement indicating whether the person satisfies the licensure requirement of this rule.

(4) If a motion satisfies these threshold requirements, the trial court must conduct an *ex parte* hearing on the motion and determine if the requested services are necessary to ensure the protection of the defendant's constitutional rights.

(c) (1) Funding shall be authorized only if, after conducting a hearing on the motion, the court determines that there is a particularized need for the requested services and that the hourly rate charged for the services is reasonable in that it is comparable to rates charged for similar services.

(2) Particularized need in the context of criminal trials and appeals is established when a defendant shows by reference to the particular facts and circumstances that the requested services relate to a matter that, considering the inculpatory evidence, is likely to be a significant issue in the defense at trial and that the requested services are necessary to protect the defendant's right to a fair trial. See Barnett, 909 S.W.2d at 423.

(3) Particularized need in the context of capital post-conviction proceedings is established when a petitioner shows, by reference to the particular facts and circumstances of the petitioner's case, that the services are necessary to establish a ground for post-conviction relief and that the petitioner will be unable to establish that ground for post-conviction relief by other available evidence. See Owens, 908 S.W.2d at 928.

(4) Particularized need cannot be established and funding requests should be denied where the motion contains only:

(A) undeveloped or conclusory assertions that such services would be beneficial;

(B) assertions establishing only the mere hope or suspicion that favorable evidence may be obtained;

(C) information indicating that the requested services relate to factual issues or matters within the province and understanding of the jury; or

(D) information indicating that the requested services fall within the capability and expertise of appointed counsel. See, e.g., Barnett, 909 S.W.2d at 430; Caldwell v. Mississippi, 472 U.S. 320, 323 n.1 (1985); State v. Abraham, 451 S.E.2d 131, 149 (N.C. 1994).

(d) (1) The director and/or the chief justice shall maintain uniformity as to the rates paid individuals or entities for services provided to indigent parties. Appointed counsel shall make every effort to obtain individuals or entities who are willing to provide services at an hourly rate less than the maximum. Although not an exclusive listing, compensation for individuals or entities providing the following services shall not exceed the following maximum hourly rates:

(A) Accident Reconstruction \$115.00

(B) Medical Services/Doctors \$250.00

(C) Psychiatrists \$250.00

(D) Psychologists \$150.00

(E) Investigators (Guilt/Sentencing) \$50.00

(F) Mitigation Specialist \$65.00



(G) DNA Expert \$200.00

(H) Forensic Anthropologist \$125.00

(I) Ballistics Expert \$ 75.00

(J) Fingerprint Expert \$ 75.00

(K) Handwriting Expert \$ 75.00

(2) For persons or entities compensated at a rate of one hundred dollars (\$100) per hour or more, time spent traveling shall be compensated at no greater than fifty percent (50%) of the approved hourly rate.

(3) Investigators shall not be compensated unless licensed by the Private Investigation and Polygraph Commission of Tennessee or exempted from this licensure requirement, except when an investigator licensed in another state is authorized by a court in Tennessee to conduct an investigation in that other state.

(4) In a post-conviction capital case, a trial court shall not authorize more than a total of \$20,000 for all investigative services, unless in its sound discretion the trial court determines that extraordinary circumstances exist that have been proven by clear and convincing evidence.

(5) In a post-conviction capital case, a trial court shall not authorize more than a total of \$25,000 for the services of all experts unless in its sound discretion the trial court determines that extraordinary circumstances exist that have been proven by clear and convincing evidence.

(6) Expenses shall not be authorized or approved for expert tests or expert services if the results or testimony generated from such tests or services will not be admissible as evidence.

(e) (1) If the requirements of sections 5(c) and (d) are satisfied and the motion is granted, the authorization shall be evidenced by a signed order of the court. Unless otherwise indicated in the order, the amount authorized includes both fees and necessary expenses under section 4(a).

(2) The order shall include a finding of particularized need and the specific facts that demonstrate particularized need as well as the information required by section 5(b)(1) or (b)(2).

(3) The court may satisfy the requirements of subsection (2) above by incorporating and attaching that portion of the defense motion that includes the specific facts supporting the finding of particularized need.

(4) Once the services are authorized by the court in which the case is pending, the order and any attachments must be submitted to the director for prior approval.

(5) If the director denies prior approval of the request, the claim shall also be transmitted to the chief justice for disposition and prior approval. The determination of the chief justice shall be final.

*Explanatory Comments: Section 5(a)(1) contains the language that previously appeared as Section 5(a). Section 5(a)(2) unequivocally provides that funding for investigative, expert, or*

*other similar services is not available in non-capital post-conviction proceedings. Section 5(b)(1) explains that counsel must make “every effort” to obtain the services of experts, investigators or others who are located within 150 miles of the court where the case is pending. Section 5(b)(2) delineates the information that must be included in or submitted with a motion requesting funding for expert or similar services. Section 5(b)(3) delineates the information that must be included in or submitted with a motion requesting funding for investigative or similar services. Section 5(c) has been revised for clarity and includes in subsections (c)(1)-(4) definitions of particularized need and the standards governing a trial court’s consideration of funding requests. Section 5(d) has been revised to provide certainty and guidance to attorneys, service providers, and trial courts. Section (5)(d)(1) establishes maximum hourly rates for certain services, instructs the director and the chief justice to maintain state-wide uniformity as to the rates paid for services, and directs appointed counsel to seek to retain individuals and/or entities willing to provide services at a rate less than the maximum. Section 5(d)(2) establishes permissible compensation rates for travel for experts paid in excess of \$100 per hour. Section 5(d)(3) establishes the licensure requirements for investigators. Section 5(d)(4) and (5) impose maximum limits on the amounts that may be approved in capital post-conviction proceedings and permit funding in excess of these amounts only upon clear and convincing evidence that extraordinary circumstances exist. Section 5(d)(6) precludes funding for expert tests or services if the results of the tests or the expert’s testimony is per se inadmissible. Section 5(e)(1)-(3) delineates the information that must be included in or attached to orders authorizing funding. Section 5(e)(4) -(5) sets out the procedure that must be followed in obtaining prior approval of the request. Section 5(e)(5) provides that only those claims denied by the director will be submitted to the chief justice for disposition. This changes prior law which required the chief justice to review every request for funding involving an hourly rate in excess of \$150 or an overall amount in excess of \$5,000, even those requests approved by the director.*

Section 6. Review of claims for compensation and reimbursement of expenses.

(a)(1) Claims for attorney compensation and expenses shall be filed with the court clerk’s office on forms approved by the AOC. The claim shall be reviewed and approved by the judge who presided over final disposition of the case prior to the submission of the claim to the AOC for payment.

(2) Time spent by counsel on a single case or proceeding shall be included in a single claim for compensation.

(3) Claims shall be supported by a copy of the court order appointing counsel or authorizing the expenditure and, in the case of expenses requiring prior approval, a copy of the approval of the director and/or the chief justice.

(4) Appointed counsel in a capital case shall file interim claims. Interim claims shall be filed at least every 180 days, but no more frequently than every 30 days. Any portion of a claim requesting payment for services rendered more than 180 days prior to the date on which the claim is approved by the court in which the services were rendered shall be deemed waived and shall not be paid. The provisions of this subsection regarding the time frame for submission of claims shall become effective January 1, 2005.

(5) Appointed counsel in non-capital cases are not permitted to file interim claims but shall file claims for compensation no later than 180 days after disposition of the case in each court in

which representation is provided. However, claims for the post-dispositional phase of a juvenile dependency and neglect proceeding shall be filed no later than 180 days from the last activity related to the case. Claims for compensation submitted after the 180-day period shall be deemed waived and shall not be paid. The provisions of this subsection regarding the time frame for submission of claims shall become effective January 1, 2005.

(6) Counsel will be held to a high degree of care in the keeping of contemporaneous time records supporting all claims and in the application for payment. Counsel is required to maintain records supporting claims for payment. Failure to provide sufficient specificity in the claim or supporting documentation may constitute grounds for denial of the claim for compensation or reimbursement.

(7) The payment of a claim by the AOC shall not prejudice the AOC's right to object to or question any claim or matter in relation thereto. Claims shall be subject to reduction for amounts included in any claim or payment previously made which are determined by the AOC not to constitute proper remuneration for compensable services. The AOC reserves the right to deduct from claims which are or shall become due and payable any amounts which are or shall become due and payable to the AOC.

(b) (1) The AOC shall examine and audit all claims for compensation and reimbursement to insure compliance with this rule and other statutory requirements.

(2) After such examination and audit and giving due consideration to state revenues, the director shall make a determination as to the compensation and/or reimbursement to be paid and cause payment to be issued in satisfaction thereof.

(3) Payment may be made directly to the person, agency, or entity providing the services.

(4) The determination by the director shall be final, except where review by the chief justice also is required. In those instances, the determination of the chief justice shall be final. The chief justice may designate another justice to perform this function if the chief justice determines that a designation is appropriate or necessary.

(5) If the director denies an attorney's fee claim in whole or substantial part, such denial shall be forwarded to the chief justice for review. The determination of the chief justice shall be final. Reductions made during the process of auditing a fee claim which are due to mathematical miscalculations or result from requests for payments not permitted by this rule shall not be forwarded to the chief justice for review.

*Explanatory Comments: Section 6(a)(1)-(3) has been revised to clarify the requirements and process for submitting claims for compensation and reimbursement. Section 6(a)(4) mandates that appointed counsel in capital cases file interim claims at least every 180 days but no more frequently than every 30 days and provides that any portion of a claim for services rendered more than 180 days prior to the date on which the claim is approved by the court will be deemed waived and not paid. The effective date of Section 6(a)(4) is January 1, 2005. Section 6(a)(5) precludes appointed counsel in non-capital cases from filing interim claims for compensation but requires them to submit claims for compensation no later than 180 days after disposition of the case in each court in which representation is provided, with the 180 day period running from*

*the date of the last case-related activity for post-dispositional phases of a dependency and neglect proceeding. Claims for compensation submitted after the 180-day period will be deemed waived and not paid. The effective date of Section 6(a)(5) is January 1, 2005. Section 6(a)(6) provides that counsel will be held to a high degree of care in record keeping and documentation of the claim. Section 6(a)(7) provides that the AOC reserves the right to review claims that come into question even if they have already been paid and establishes that the AOC may recoup any overpayment by setting off the amount of any such overpayment against claims that may be filed. Section 6(b) delineates how claims are audited, approved for payment, and how payments are made. Section 6(b)(4) provides that the determination of the director and/or the chief justice is final. Unlike prior law, Section 6 does not provide for an appeal to the Tennessee Supreme Court from the decision of the director or the chief justice. Section 6(b)(4) also provides that the chief justice may designate another justice to review these claims if the chief justice determines that designation is appropriate or necessary. Section 6(b)(5) sets out those instances where an attorney may appeal the director's decisions to the chief justice.*